

then, of course, there are the circumstances, under which emergency power could be invoked.

President.—The vote of the Council could not be obtained for meeting this expenditure. It is an expenditure that had to be immediately incurred, and we could not wait till the Council met to consider the demand and then to pass it. The payment was necessitated by the supply of these 125 muskets and the demand for immediate payment. We had no time to wait for the Council to meet. Hence it was considered an urgent demand.

Mr. N. Padmanabha Menon.—My question is whether the Standing Finance Committee could not be consulted.

President.—Then, we have to call them every time, every time an expenditure has to be incurred. There is more important business to attend to. The only point here is to see whether the expenditure incurred was unnecessary and could have been avoided. That is all that you want to know. Why should we do a thing that is not really necessary? There is nothing of that sort in this case.

Mr. N. Padmanabha Menon.—I do not want to scrutinise any of the items of expenditure. This way of using emergency powers will be a bad precedent.

President.—I think it will not be a bad precedent at all.

Mr. A. B. Salem.—I want to know whether you were convinced of the urgency of the expenditure in these 9 cases before us.

President.—He said these are cases in which action had to be taken under section 16 (9) of the Regulation. I went into the matter and agreed.

Mr. A. B. Salem.—I want to know whether you were satisfied that they were urgent matters.

President.—Yes. I was satisfied.

Voting of Demands for Grants.—(contd.)

Demand IX—Forests - Rs. 1.85 lakhs.—(contd.)

Mr. C. A. Kunjunny Raja.—A point of information, Sir. Yesterday there was a discussion about the figures supplied by the Hon'ble Member for Chalakkudi. I do not know how these figures were given. In page 671 of *the Council Proceedings*, he says he has taken those figures from *the Administration Report*. I have not been able to verify them. If the Conservator of Forests be pleased to correct the mistakes, we will be very glad.

President.—Of course, there is some sort of mystifying the figures. I will be able to tell the Council how the matter stands. For instance, the other day you gave some figures saying that our Tramway and Forest Departments are working profitably, and those figures were given with reference to the year 1102—the

official year—and the year 1100 is over. We are now in 1101. Do you follow? For the time being, don't bother yourself with figures. I want some information. I have tried and got a lot of figures. I do not know whether I understood them properly. One thing I have to say is with regard to 1102. It was pointed out that as against the income of 2 lakhs 89,000 rupees from timber brought down by the Tramway we have to spend 1,57,000 rupees on the Tramway; and so we got a net profit of 1,32,000. That is for the coming year. Let us take 1100. Can you supply similar figures for 1100 just to enable me to know how the profit and loss stand? Let there be a clarifying of the matter. Let us understand the position. For 1102, i.e., for the coming year we found out that for the Tramway we have to spend 1,57,000 rupees, and Mr. Govinda Menon said that by the sale of timber transported by Tramway and other earnings, we would be able to get 2,89,000 so that it works out at a profit of Rs. 1,32,000. Of course, that is a matter for the future. Relating to a matter for the future, we cannot say whether we are going to realise that profit or more. Now, can you supply similar figures for 1100?

Mr. K. Govinda Menon.—Tramway—2,11,872—earning; and expenditure—1,75,087.

Mr. A. B. Salem.—That includes the revenue from timber not exported by the Tramway.

Mr. K. Govinda Menon.—I must have my file. *The Administration Report* will give the correct figures.

President.—We are concerned only with the question of Forests Revenue by the working of the Tramway. They get down the timber from other sources also by means of other transports. In order to understand whether the Forest Department is working profitably and to see whether this Tramway is a useful institution or whether it is a wasteful expenditure, we have to know how much money is spent and how much money we get by bringing timber by the Tramway. So other timber cannot be taken into account in this connection. Do you follow me? You just gave the figures for 1102; can you give those for 1100?

Mr. K. Govinda Menon.—These figures are not available here. But we have called for specific figures in connection with the amount of timber received. That will place the matter clearly before you. Another point we have to know in this connection is the cost of the stock of timber unsold and kept in the depot. Deducting the value of the timber that was already got down in the previous year, and adding the value of the timber that remains unsold during the year, we have to

work out the figures in this manner, and then you will be able to know whether this Tramway is a useful thing or whether it is working at a loss.

Mr. I. E. Ambooken.—In this connection, we have to refer to the answer given by the department to question No. 136 of this session, as to how much money can be estimated to have been gained by bringing Sirkar timber by the Tramway in 1100.

Mr. K. Govinda Menon.—The correct answer is given. I shall read the question.

മിസ്റ്റർ കെ. ശങ്കരൻ നമ്പൂതിരി - “അന്യന്മാരുടെ മരങ്ങൾ ഹാർവെസ്റ്റ് ചെയ്തുകൊണ്ടുപോകുന്നതിനുള്ള നിരക്കനുസരിച്ച് കൂലി ചുമത്തുന്ന പക്ഷം 98, 99, 100 ഈ ഓരോ കൊല്ലങ്ങളിലും കൊണ്ടുപോന്നിട്ടുള്ള സർക്കാർ മരങ്ങൾക്ക് ചുമത്തുന്ന സംഖ്യ എത്രയാണെന്ന് പറയാൻ ഗവണ്മെന്റിന് ഭയപ്പെടുകയോ?”

അതിന് ഗവണ്മെന്റിന്റെ മറുപടി ഇതാണ്—

“1098—രൂ. 84,389 2 8

1099—രൂ. 81,410 15 7

1100—രൂ. 54,485 8 9.”

President.—That is only the charges we have to incur. We have to take into account the value of timber also, if we do not resort to this transport. There is some confusion, Mr. Ambooken.

Mr. K. Govinda Menon.—The Tramway is being worked to get down timber both for private purposes and for Sirkar purposes. Having those figures on one side and the maintenance figures or expenditure on the other side, it will be found that the Tramway is working at a loss. There is another fact to be considered. We get timber, and if we do not transport it, the timber will either die or wither. That has also to be taken into account.

Mr. I. E. Ambooken.—The value of the whole timber has to be included in the income from the Forests.

Mr. K. Govinda Menon.—Only transport charges have to be considered as the income of the Tramway, not the value of timber.

President.—There is also another thing. The Tramway is employed to bring timber. The value of timber is also to be taken into account. It is enough, if you will supply the figures.

Mr. K. Govinda Menon.—For the figures of 1102, I have got the file here. For those of 1101 I cannot supply now, as I have not the file with me.

President.—That is what I find to be necessary, considering the matter carefully. If you can place the figures before us,

I think there will be no confusion due to the bringing of all sorts of miscellaneous figures of the Forest Department as a whole. And these figures of the Tramway alone are required in order to understand whether the Tramway is being worked at a loss. What is the value of timber realised in a particular year brought by the Tramway? You have got to deduct the value of timber that has been stored in the previous year and to add to it the value of timber that has to be brought in the year. Then, you see what the value is, and then you can find whether it is a loss. Now, will you be able to supply them? Can you say it is no loss up till now?

Mr. K. Govinda Menon.—No, Sir. Probably, in the year after the floods. We could not work the Tramway for about nine months, and we had to pay the establishment. There was a loss.

Dr. A. R. Menon.—The figures of some 11 years may be taken, and the average may be struck, and then we can find out the loss or gain.

President.—But then, he has included other revenues also.

Dr. A. R. Menon.—Because the Tramway is dependent upon the Forests.

President.—We have got the figures of the whole Forest Department.

Dr. A. R. Menon.—It will be so, because the Forest is dependent on the Tramway, and the Tramway is dependent upon the Forest Department.

Mr. K. Govinda Menon.—As stated by the Member for Irinjalakkuda, we have also calculated the revenue brought by other agencies, not by the Tramway alone, for the 11 years, which must be excluded.

Mr. C. Achyuta Menon.—Those figures are in favour of the Tramway. But even then the Tramway is working at a loss, on an average of 57,000 rupees for a year.

Mr. K. Govinda Menon.—That is wrong. I have got the figures here.

		Rs.
1096	—Revenue	3,79,617
Do	Gross Expenditure	3,19,094
1097	Revenue	3,69,000
Do	Gross expenditure	3,46,111
1098	Revenue	4,53,793
Do	Gross expenditure	3,66,758
1099	Revenue	3,58,125
Do	Gross expenditure	3,43,697

1100	Revenue	4,75,633
Do	Gross expenditure	3,68,638

President.—Net of each year may also be given.

Mr. K. Govinda Menon.—

1096	..	60,523
1097		22,889
1098		87,035
1099		14,428
1100	...	1,06,995

Mr. C. Achyuta Menon.—These are exactly my figures.

Mr. K. Govinda Menon.—The Hon'ble Member for Mulakunnattukayam said that it was working at a loss.

Mr. C. Achyuta Menon.—I shall prove it. Please, wait till you hear me. According to the statement handed over by Mr. King, in 1096, from Forests the revenue is Rs. 3,79,617.

That is a figure given by you.

		Rs.
Expenditure		1,77,442
From Tramway you get		23,079
Expenditure		1,55,169
Both together-revenue		70,085

Mr. K. Govinda Menon.—No, no. Rs. 3,79,617 revenue from Forests.

Forest expenditure Rs. 1,77,442.

Mr. C. Achyuta Menon.—From the Forest Department we get a net revenue of Rs. 3,19,094.

Then under the head "Tramway" the expenditure is 1,55,169 and revenue 23,079. The net expenditure is Rs. 1,32,090.

Mr. K. Govinda Menon.—1,55,169. Income 23,079. That deducted from 1,79,000, you get the balance. That is for 1096. So, 1,32,090 is the expenditure. The sum of 9,652 is for capital.

Mr. C. Achyuta Menon.—The capital need not be added.

Mr. K. Govinda Menon.—Then you have to deduct capital for every year. I have done it. There is also of maintenance.

President.—Then only you will get the correct figure. Suppose you work out the figure. Then you will get the result.

Mr. K. Govinda Menon.—I can supply that figure by taking the detailed budget figures for every year.

Mr. C. Achyuta Menon.—You won't find from the budget what quantity of timber was brought down from Parambikulam.

Mr. K. Govinda Menon.—I have got it.

Mr. C. Achyuta Menon.—I may point out one thing. Even with this figure you will find that Rs. 57,000 is the net income

for the last five years from 1096 to 1100. Deduct from that Rs. 25,000 on account of rubber estates.

Mr. K. Govinda Menon.—Rubber estate is not included in this.

President.—This includes.

Mr. C. Achyuta Menon.—That is what I want to point out. Including that saving, the average net revenue during the last five years is only Rs. 57,000. Deduct 25,000 rupees on account of the field rent of the rubber estates, which has absolutely nothing to do with the "Tramway". There is only 32,000 remaining. Deduct again 2,000 on account of the hire of elephants. There is but 30,000 remaining. Then there is the income from the Palappilli, Paravattani, Pottundi and Machat forests on account of timber, firewood and minor forest produce. Deduct all this from the net income, and there will not be a pie remaining. That is how the Tramway is working. The Forest Department is being kept up from the income of other forests, and not of the Arukomban Working Circle with the Tramway. That is quite clear.

President.—But we have to consider all the facts and figures before we can decide the question.

Mr. C. Achyuta Menon.—Another point that I have to mention is this. It is 18 years since the Tramway began work systematically, i. e., from 1083 to 1100. During the first 9 years, the first half of that period, the net income of the Forest Department including the Tramway was 2,16,000. In the second half, the net income was only 96,000. If the Arukomban Working Circle had been worked as vigorously during the second period as in the first, the Tramway would automatically have abolished itself in 1094 or 1095.

President.—Would have done its work altogether.

Mr. C. Achyuta Menon.—Yes. Latterly the work has been unnecessarily spread over a number of years. Look at the Conservator's proposals. Now, he wants to bring down 12,000 candies of timber next year. There are only above 33,000 candies of timber to be removed by the Tramway. If the Tramway works properly, it can bring down at least 24 thousand candies per year, i. e., 2,000 per month.

President.—How many candies can you bring down by the Tramway?

Mr. K. Govinda Menon.—More than 20,000 a year.

Mr. C. Achyuta Menon.—There are only 33,000 candies to be brought. The whole of that can be brought down at that rate in 18 months. Why should you go in for 36 months and double the expenditure?

Mr. A. B. Salem.—Treble.

Mr. C. Achyuta Menon.—No. Half the period. 33,000 candies of timber will fetch a gross income of above 8 lakhs of

rupees. The Tramway will cost, in the meantime, in 3 years, 5 lakhs of rupees. Then, the felling and removing of the timber to the Tramway will cost another lakh. The extra establishment, necessitated by the working of Arukomban Working Circle, will come to at least 60 or 70 thousand rupees. Altogether, the income will be, if the work is spread over 3 years, less than 2 lakhs. If it is done in 18 months, the net income will be over four lakhs. The Member for Chalakkudi wants to reduce the allotment. I want to double the allotment so as to do the thing in the shortest time possible. During this period of 18 months we have ample time to consider and decide what we should do with the Tramway, whether it is to be abolished or whether any other use is to be made of it or not. The whole thing will be facilitated by working the Arukomban Ghat Circle in such a manner as to finish the whole operation in a minimum of time.

Mr. K. Govinda Menon.—18 months? I may even try to do it in 1 year, provided there is a market for the timber.

Mr. C. Achyuta Menon.—The market has nothing to do with it. This is the question of Tramway working. If there is no market now, timber is kept in stock till there is one.

President.—At Chalakkudi.

Mr. K. Govinda Menon.—But there is no ground. A storing place you must have. That is the difficulty.

President.—To store the timber?

Mr. C. Achyuta Menon.—Surely, it is not an insurmountable difficulty.

Mr. C. A. Kunjunni Raja.—A plot may be taken out on lease.

Mr. Chakko Cheruvathur.—Or one may even be acquired.

Mr. A. B. Salem.—May I know, Sir, before I take part in the discussion, whether the question of appointing a Committee which was promised last year, has been considered?

President.—For what purpose?

Mr. A. B. Salem.—For examining the state of the Forest Department. I refer to page 624 of Volume I. It is stated: "The Conservator will not be able to say anything in the matter. In the light of the discussion that has been carried on in the House, the feasibility of appointing a Committee will be considered." Then, again, "all the discussions will be borne in mind, and the advice of appointing a Committee will be considered. This is all I can say at present".

President.—The Finance Committee is going on with it. The Finance Committee has been asked to examine all the figures, everything connected with the administration of the Tramway and the Forests.

Mr. A. B. Salem.—In reply to the Hon'ble Member for Trichur it was stated that the question of appointing a Committee will be considered in the year following. That means this year. We have now come to the end of it. I wish to know what steps have been taken by the Government, if any.

President.—Mr. Achyuta Menon is saying that he is collecting all the figures on the subject. Do you want another Committee?

Mr. C. Achyuta Menon.—There is the Special Finance Committee.

Dr. A. R. Menon.—That is within the purview of the Special Finance Committee.

Mr. C. Achyuta Menon.—All the figures will come to the Special Finance Committee. We have already called for those figures.

Mr. A. B. Salem.—Very glad to hear all that.

President.—You want a separate Committee?

Mr. A. B. Salem.—That is what the Government said that they will consider.

President.—I suppose the Special Finance Committee will carry on that work.

Mr. A. B. Salem.—Then, I have nothing to say. My question was for information, whether this matter of appointing a Committee to examine the Forest Department has been considered.

President.—The terms of reference are very wide.

Mr. A. B. Salem.—The Special Finance Committee will work, but we ask for a small Committee to examine the working of the Forest and the Tramway, particularly, because, last year, there was so much discussion here with reference to the Tramway and the Forests and the necessity thereof that we pressed that the whole policy may be examined and the figures placed before the House, and the Government promised to consider the appointment of a Committee. I only ask whether any steps were taken or not. The Special Finance Committee has nothing to do with this, particularly.

Mr. C. Achyuta Menon.—I forgot to mention one important matter, a matter which has been lost sight of by the House in this discussion. In all, we incurred a capital expenditure of over 20 lakhs of rupees on the Forest—Tramway. No account has been taken of the interest on that amount. We may ignore half of that amount, which was provided by the Forest Department. The other 10 lakhs we actually borrowed and paid interest at the rate of 40,000 rupees a year for 15 years. At least, that amount must be taken into account—6 lakhs of rupees.

Dr. A. R. Menon.—What about Railways? You get only 3½%.

President.—What do we get?

Dr. A. R. Menon.—What rate of interest do you get for the Railways?

Mr. C. Achyuta Menon.—About 4½ per cent on an average.

Dr. A. R. Menon.—That is money invested.

Mr. C. Achyuta Menon.—On 70 lakhs we do get about 4½ per cent. There is also the convenience to the public. That has also to be taken into account. But the Tramway does not do any good to the public. It is entirely a Commercial undertaking, intended solely to the working of the Forest.

Mr. K. Govinda Menon.—But no borrowed money was invested on the Tramway.

Mr. C. Achyuta Menon.—Ten lakhs was borrowed for the Tramway.

President.—No borrowing? We borrowed only for the Railway?

Mr. C. Achyuta Menon.—We raised two debenture loans, one for the Railway, the other for the Forest Tramway.

Mr. K. Govinda Menon.—I beg your pardon. I differ.

President.—I know we borrowed for the Railway.

Mr. K. Krishna Pisharodi.—I am not quite sure. Sir, my information is that ten lakhs for the Railway and ten lakhs for the Tramway were raised by two debenture loans.

Mr. C. Achyuta Menon.—One was raised during the time of Mr. Rajagopala chari and the other during the time of Mr. Patiabhiraama Rao. two years after the Railway was actually opened and four years after the first debenture loan was raised. What was that for? Not for Railway, certainly.

Mr. K. Govinda Menon.—I do not know why a debenture loan was raised.

President.—We do not want discussion of this sort. We are engaged with the cut motions. All this time was employed in getting information. The last cut motion we were engaged in is No. 56. Mr. Ouseph is absent.

In the absence of Mr. C. A. Ouseph, Motion No. 56 was considered withdrawn.

Mr. T. A. Ramachandra Ayyar.—Sir, I move for a cut of Rs. 5,000 in Demand IX. There are signs of a falling income from the Forest Department. It is time that retrenchments are effected in the department.

President.—You wish to reduce the total allotment by Rs. 5,000.

Mr. T. A. Ramachandra Ayyar.—Yes. On the other hand, there is an increase in the amount of non-votable charges without any attempt to reduce expenditure on any other item. I propose to express my disapproval of the policy of the Government in administering this department, and for that purpose I propose a cut of Rs. 5,000.

Dr. A. R. Menon.—Is general discussion permitted on these subjects?

President.—We are going on with this cut motion No. 57.

Dr. A. R. Menon.—In Tramway?

President.—Forest total. Anybody else?

Mr. N. Padmanabha Menon.—From the trend of the discussion we had, I think, there is some confusion in the issues involved. The policy discussed in this House was as regards the Tramway, and the question was discussed here whether the Tramway should be continued, as it is working or under other conditions. That is why I rise to oppose this motion. This motion does not properly rise now. On that ground, I oppose this motion.

President.—We discuss about Forest administration only. No other Member?

Mr. T. A. Ramachandra Ayyar.—I withdraw my motion under Forest total.

The motion was withdrawn with leave.

The question of granting Demand No. IX,—Forests,—was put to votes and carried.

Demand X—Tramway—Rs. 1.52 lakhs.

President.—The next demand is Demand No. X,—Tramway.

Mr. K. Govinda Menon.—Sir, I rise to ask my demand of Rs. 1,52,260 under X Tramway for the year 1102.

The details are as follow:

For capital expenditure, nothing is demanded; under "office establishment"—Rs. 4,884; Travelling allowance—Rs. 650; Service labels, Postage and Telegraph charges, Miscellaneous—Rs. 265; Engineering section, including Permanent Way Inspectors, section mates, etc., with their hill allowance—these are employed to look after and supervise the lines—Rs. 5,448; Gang coolies Rs. 12,924, Ballast—this is required to keep the line dry and less filling to maintain the level of the formation—Rs. 3,500; Rails with fittings—2 miles track to renew damaged portions—the present rails are about 20 years old Rs. 11,000; sleepers Rs. 15,000. Out of this pocket expense is only about Rs. 5,000. The rest is cost of timber given to the Forest Department.

Bridges—most of the bridges are timber-built about 15 or 20 years ago; many of them have to be rebuilt, as the timber has become rotten and unsafe for engines: for that Rs. 9,100; Repairs to Staff quarters, gang lines, etc.—Rs. 2,408; Maintenance and purchase of tools and plant, including water pumps—Rs. 1,150; Loco-expenses, establishment charges, leave allowance and workshop—Rs. 24,00; running expenses—Rs. 10,536, including drivers, fitters and all that; fuel, coal, etc.—20,000. Out of this amount about 6,000 goes to the Forest Department as cost of fuel; for watering engines, workshop engine, including stores, repairing damaged portions—Rs. 2,792; temporary staff include the extra staff employed in fever season; oil, tallow, etc., for lubrication of all machinery and engines—Rs. 3,000. Wages and stores including machine staff, renewal of loco-parts, especially of 3 engines which have become very unserviceable—Rs. 15,731; maintenance of the machinery workshop, labour and repair—Rs. 4,300; coaching include making new trucks, repair, labour for the same, etc.—Rs. 9,850; traffic establishment—Rs. 10,728; lighting, office furniture and lashing chains Rs. 200; general establishment including Hospital, Anchal, Telephone service, etc.,—Rs. 3,469. Only the bare necessities are being asked for in the above and only such indispensable items as are necessary to maintain the line safely to do its work.

President.—Any information wanted?

Mr. N. Padmanabha Menon.—May I know what is the average number of gang coolies working per day?

Mr. K. Govinda Menon.—I think 15 gangs of 7 men each—6 coolies and 1 mate.

Dr. A. R. Menon.—Beg your pardon?

Mr. K. Govinda Menon.—15 gangs of 7 men in each gang—6 coolies and 1 maistry.

Mr. N. Padmanabha Menon.—And the average wages given to each cooly?

Mr. K. Govinda Menon.—Three rates.

President. What is the average pay of each gang?

Mr. K. Govinda Menon.—15 gangs at Rs. 10 each.

No. 1 gang—Rs. 10—7 coolies of Rs. 6.

No. 2 gang—Rs. 10—6 coolies at Rs. 6—8—0.

No. 3 gang—Rs. 10—6 coolies at Rs. 7.

Mr. N. Padmanabha Menon. I want only the total wages given per day for all this.

Dr. A. R. Menon. Roughly.

Mr. K. Govinda Menon.—They go up, and their pay is increased. Rs. 1,077 per mensem.

Mr. N. Padmanabha Menon.—That is only for the coolies; is it not?

Dr. A. R. Menon.—For the gangs that are working on the line?

Mr. A. B. Salem.—These men are engaged by month or day?

Mr. K. Govinda Menon.—Monthly they are engaged; and the payments are monthly payments.

Dr. A. R. Menon.—May I ask how many people are employed in the department altogether in cutting timber or associated work? What will be the pay given to these people, roughly, in a month? How many are employed for cutting and felling the tree?

President.—That is done by contract, i. e., the cutting, felling, etc.

Mr. K. Govinda Menon.—That work is done by the contractor who engages coolies.

Dr. A. R. Menon.—What I want to know is how much money is disposed of to coolies whether by the Government or by the contractor per mensem.

President.—His point is just to understand how many poor persons are employed.

Mr. K. Govinda Menon.—That is between 800 and 1,000 a month.

President.—Including our coolies and the contractor's coolies.

Mr. K. Govinda Menon.—Between 800 and 1,000.

Dr. A. R. Menon.—What will be the wages? I want only roughly.

Mr. K. Govinda Menon.—Not less than 8 annas a day, maximum 1—4—0.

Mr. C. Achyuta Menon.—The permanent establishment costs Rs. 40,000.

Dr. A. R. Menon.—That is a lakh of rupees you pay in the matter of wages. Thank you.

Mr. K. Govinda Menon.—That is departmentally.

President.—Any information wanted?

Mr. A. B. Salem.—Some of these coolies are paid Rs. 7 a month. If the average pay is not less than 8 annas a day, it will be Rs. 15.

Mr. K. Govinda Menon.—It is for the coolies in the gang.

President.—These coolies are not paid for the month?

Mr. K. Govinda Menon.—Daily.

President.—The Conservator says that he has 15 gangs and one or two maistries. They are paid Rs. 6, 6—8—0 and Rs. 7 and the maistries 10 and 11.

Mr. A. B. Salem.—He pays 7 rupees a month, that being for full-time work as of the department, so that they do not get 8 annas a day.

President.—Is it your point that we should pay more?

Mr. A. B. Salem.—A statement was made in this House that coolies are paid on an average not less than 8 annas and some, more. I want to point out that it is not so. You pay Rs. 7, Rs. 6-8-0, etc.

Mr. K. Govinda Menon.—One refers to the gang coolies and the other, to those of the contractor.

Mr. A. B. Salem.—You are not paying, and the contractor is paying. You do not know what the contractor is paying.

President.—With regard to the coolies employed by the Sirkar, they are not paid 8 annas or 12 annas. It is the contractor's coolies. Ours is the gang coolies, and they have a monthly rate.

Dr. A. R. Menon.—Not more than Rs. 7. I have to ask one more question. Of the quantity of timber taken from the forest, how much is made use of for local consumption, that is, the quantity of timber roughly used for local purposes within the State.

Mr. K. Govinda Menon.—It might roughly be 4,000 candies.

Mr. N. Padmanabha Menon.—I want some more information. Here there is provision for sleepers—sub-head (a).

President.—Rs. 15,000.

Mr. N. Padmanabha Menon.—I believe, it is wrong. I have made some calculations. I believe the Conservator will correct me. I think that between one sleeper and another there is a distance of one yard. It is on that basis that I have made this calculation.

President.—Is the intervening space one yard?

Mr. K. Govinda Menon.—That depends on the section of rail used. If the rails are light, they will not stand tonnage. We have to use more sleepers. So far as the Tramway is concerned, it is only 2 feet 6 inches, not 3 feet.

Mr. N. Padmanabha Menon.—Taking on that basis approximately, for 49 miles, the number of sleepers required will be below 90,000.

Mr. K. Govinda Menon.—It is 54 miles.

President.—50 plus 4, i. e., 54 miles.

Mr. K. Govinda Menon.—I mean, 50 miles straight line and 4 miles inclines and sidings together. We have got 54 miles in all. So roughly below 1 lakh.

Mr. A. B. Salem.—My question is whether in inclines you want sleepers. There are rails, and you can go on rails. I wish to know whether there are sleepers on inclines as a matter of fact.

President.—What is your question?

Mr. A. B. Salem.—There are 2 inclines, of $3\frac{1}{2}$ miles, and for these do they want sleepers?

Mr. C. Achyuta Menon.—Certainly.

Mr. N. Padmanabha Menon.—Some of the Members here are sleeping. That is the difficulty. (*Laughter.*)

Roughly putting it, the number of sleepers will be below one lakh. For our purposes here, take it as one lakh, and the cost of each sleeper to be on an average of Re. 1. I do not know whether I am correct. It is a little less than that. About 12,000 sleepers and 15,000 rupees

Mr. K. Govinda Menon.—Little more than that.

Mr. N. Padmanabha Menon.—I understand that there are 2 sorts of sleepers—one, the ordinary, and the other, the sleepers used in curves and other places. Those sleepers will be long and the other uniform in length. And I take it to be roughly Re. 1.

President.—But, on an average of Re. 1, will it be correct? They are of Re. 1 and Re. 1—4—0.

Mr. K. Govinda Menon.—Special sleepers will be about 100 altogether for points and crossings. 15,000 rupees for 13,000 sleepers roughly.

Mr. N. Padmanabha Menon.—We will take it to be on an average of Re. 1—4—0. Even then—I am not concerned with the amount involved—annually, we used to budget for a certain amount. I believe it is nearly Rs. 15,000. Last year the actuals were Rs. 18,938. The amount budgetted for 1100 was Rs. 18,800, the revised estimate is 18,800. This year 15,000. Year by year, we used to budget for these sleepers. Suppose the whole work is undertaken within the course of 3 years. Will it not be profitable for the department? I believe, in the South Indian Railway generally, they change sleepers at the end of 6 or 8 years.

Mr. K. Govinda Menon.—They renew every year.

Mr. N. Padmanabha Menon. Not all. Only a few.

President.—Is it your point that we need not have sleepers at all?

Mr. N. Padmanabha Menon—If you change these sleepers within the course of 3 years, will it not be more profitable to the Government than the present arrangement?

Mr. K. Govinda Menon.—About $1/8$ or $1/9$ or $1/10$ will be bad sleepers. Good sleepers we won't renew. Why should we throw away good sleepers?

Mr. N. Padmanabha Menon.—I do not think they will have to be changed year by year.

Mr. K. Govinda Menon.—That depends upon the state of the line. In some places it will remain for 8 or 9 years.

Mr. N. Padmanabha Menon.—I want this explanation. We have seen that nearly 105 gang coolies are employed. Are most of them employed daily to renew these sleepers? Only then we can understand the budget figure of Rs. 12,924—the wages of gang coolies. That is accepting the explanation given now that 105 coolies are working daily at the rate of wages given the total cost of renewing sleepers will be the cost of sleepers *plus* the wages of gang coolies. That comes to nearly Rs. 28,000. Apart from the temporary establishment necessary to carry on these renewals, suppose the Tramway is constructed within a period of 3 years.

Mr. C. Achyuta Menon.—No.

Mr. N. Padmanabha Menon.—It may be corrected. Suppose we take up renewal work and do it within the course of 3 years, will it not be a more profitable arrangement for the Government?

President.—Mr. Padmanabha Menon, you have to renew these sleepers year by year. You cannot say: 'Now, we have repaired all these sleepers; you may rest satisfied.' You have to do this work year by year.

Mr. I. E. Ambooken.—Every year we will have to renew.

President.—For maintenance of roads, renewal of roads is to be done year by year.

Mr. N. Padmanabha Menon.—Rs. 15,000 is budgetted for the sleepers. Is this amount for renewal only in certain places?

Mr. C. Achyuta Menon.—No.

President.—No. In places where the sleepers have gone bad.

Mr. N. Padmanabha Menon.—If that is the explanation for renewals, is it possible to get the figure for renewals in all places outright?

Mr. K. Govinda Menon.—No outright renewals. Only damaged ones are thrown away, and new sleepers are put in.

President.—No special renewals at all. Ordinary renewal.

Mr. N. Padmanabha Menon.—By special renewals, I mean by taking away sleepers, say for 1 mile length—and putting new sleepers in those places.

Mr. K. Govinda Menon.—Nothing of that kind. The gang coolies—are not employed for renewal of sleepers alone. Keeping the line and side drains in proper order, attending to bridges, everything—these are also their duties. Sleeper renewal is only part of the work they have to attend to.

Mr. N. Padmanabha Menon.—For bridge works, separate amount is provided “under repairs of bridges.”

President.—That is necessary. It is not for cooly work.

Mr. K. Govinda Menon.—Special coolies are employed in the case of timber bridges.

Mr. N. Padmanabha Menon.—And are these damaged sleepers that are removed, auctioned?

Mr. K. Govinda Menon.—Used as fuel. I do not think anybody will come, if you auction.

President.—No good at all.

Mr. C. A. Kunjunni Raja.—What is this “loss of stores”? Page 34. Rs. 1,150. How is that brought about?

Mr. K. Govinda Menon.—It includes tools and plant also. There is no loss on stores at all. You have it as one of the headings?

Mr. C. A. Kunjunni Raja.—Why do you put that heading?

Mr. K. Govinda Menon.—There is nothing special against it.

Mr. C. A. Kunjunni Raja.—Out of two heads only one has amount against it.

Mr. K. Govinda Menon.—It is only for tools.

Mr. C. A. Kunjunni Raja.—With regard to fuel, coal, coanut shells, etc., Rs. 20,000 has been provided. Has anybody checked the fuel necessary for the engine? To my information, only three engines are working every day, and one ballast for the removal of fuel. If we take into account the capacity of these four engines, the question arises whether Rs. 20,000 worth of fuel is absolutely necessary.

Mr. K. Govinda Menon.—That has been checked. We have got eight locomotives.

Mr. N. Padmanabha Menon.—On a point of order. I wish to ask whether Mr. King, who is not a Member of this

House, can be allowed to speak in this House. The rules do not allow that.

President.—He is supplying information to the Conservator who in turn transmits to the House the information. I think we can allow that.

Mr. N. Padmanabha Menon.—It is a matter concerning the privilege of the Members of this Council. The necessary answer must come from the Member in charge of the Department.

Mr. A. B. Salem.—We can take it from the Conservator of Forests.

President.—We want information. That is the point.

Mr. K. Govinda Menon.—There are figures to show how much tons of fuel are required for a mile to an engine. So if you take into account all the boilers that run on particular lines, you might arrive at this figure.

Mr. C. A. Kunjunni Raja.—May I know whether the Tramway Engineer has tested the capacity and found whether we require so much fuel as it was hitherto consuming.

Mr. K. Govinda Menon.—It has been tested, and the materials are to be relied on. One man connected with the Tramway once said that we were using too much of fuel, and that he could manage with a smaller quantity. He cut down the quantity with the result that the drivers began to steal fuel from the forest or from the contractor.

Mr. C. A. Kunjunni Raja.—With regard to stores, we spend Rs. 15,000 and odd every year for the repair of engines. I suppose it is for the repair of old engines. Is not the price of a new engine somewhere about Rs. 12,000?

Mr. K. Govinda Menon.—The price of an engine was originally only Rs. 10,000. But now there is a slight increase.

Mr. C. A. Kunjunni Raja.—Will it not be better for us to purchase new engines, instead of repairing the old ones?

Mr. K. Govinda Menon.—The most essential part of an engine is the boiler. If that is renewed, it becomes new. The defect is only in the boiler. The other parts are all right.

Mr. C. A. Kunjunni Raja.—Why is it in this department alone all the engineering works are done departmentally, instead of by contractors? I wish to draw your attention to one specific instance. The Myladappen bridge was constructed in Chingam 1101 by the department, and the bridge went out of repair in Thulam 1100; that is; within a period of 4 months.

Mr. K. Govinda Menon.—I think the Member is referring to the Kuriarkutti bridge. The bridge referred to by the

Hon'ble Member was only slightly damaged, and it has been repaired since. The damage was only to the embankments.

Mr. C. A. Kunjunni Raja.—Then I am mistaken. My information is that it is Myladappen. The Kuriarkutti bridge went out of order within two months, after the work was completed.

Mr. K. Govinda Menon.—It was due to floods and not to defective construction.

Mr. C. A. Kunjunni Raja.—Is not the cost higher than what obtains in the Public Works Department for similar purposes?

Mr. K. Govinda Menon.—Certainly not.

Mr. C. A. Kunjunni Raja.—May I know whether anybody has hitherto taken stock of the articles in the Workshop? Then, with regard to the trucks, may I know what will the price of a truck come to? Under "materials", we find Rs. 7,050 budgetted.

President.—It is for repairing the old trucks and manufacturing also new ones.

Mr. K. Govinda Menon.—Only wheels are purchased, and all other things are made here.

Mr. C. A. Kunjunni Raja.—My information is that it will not cost more than Rs. 400 for a new truck. Instead of repairing these old ones, cannot new ones be purchased?

President.—What will be the price of a new truck?

Mr. K. Govinda Menon.—It will be between Rs. 800 and Rs. 1,000.

Mr. A. B. Salem.—Last year it was said that the cost of overhauling the Tramway aggregates to a lakh and odd rupees. This year what is the exact amount budgetted?

President.—No overhauling this year.

Mr. A. B. Salem.—The expenditure aggregates to a lakh and odd for the three years. May I know how much is "the odd", and what expenditure we have incurred for the last three years?

President.—Was overhauling done this year?

Mr. K. Govinda Menon.—A portion was done.

Mr. A. B. Salem.—Is overhauling over?

President.—We would not allow any more overhauling, and we are simply maintaining the thing.

Mr. A. B. Salem.—We have budgetted Rs. 37,000 for this year. This; I may state here, is from the answer supplied to me by the Secretary to the Diwan to a question. (Page 627, Vol. I, Part 8).

Mr. K. Govinda Menon.—The aggregate amount sanctioned is Rs. 1,25,150.

Mr. A. B. Salem.—Out of the total amount of Rs. 1,25,150 Rs. 56,508-0-2 was spent in 1100 and 1101, and then Rs. 68,841 is not still expended. But in 1101, you budgetted only for Rs. 30,000. May I know what was the actual amount spent this year?

President.—It is in consequence of that we are budgetting Rs. 30,000 for this year.

Mr. A. B. Salem.—May I know how much in 1101 itself was spent, or how much you have spent from Chingam 1101 up to this? At least last year's accounts must be ready.

Mr. K. Govinda Menon.—The figures for 1100 and 1101 are both clubbed together. I will be ready with the figures this afternoon.

Mr. N. Padmanabha Menon.—A question was asked by the Hon'ble Member for Jenmies why is it many works are being done departmentally, instead of entrusting them with the contractors.

Mr. K. Govinda Menon.—Since it is a malarial area, we cannot expect contractors to take up the work there. So it is done by the department itself. It is not done generally, but only in a few cases, now and then.

Mr. N. Padmanabha Menon.—In the case of fuel supply, contractors cut fuel from everywhere, and I think they have to go up the hills. How is it done?

Mr. K. Govinda Menon.—The fuel contract is given for the three sections together. If I allow the contractor to cut fuel only from the second or third section, he will not come forward.

Mr. N. Padmanabha Menon.—May I ask whether tenders are called for; when there are works to be done in that department?

Mr. K. Govinda Menon.—Tenders are called for in some cases only.

Mr. N. Padmanabha Menon.—May I know in how many cases tenders were invited?

Mr. K. Govinda Menon.—In the majority of cases, tenders are invited.

Mr. N. Padmanabha Menon.—May I know whether persons, in case they take up contracts, are allowed to work in the Tramway Workshop?

Mr. K. Govinda Menon.—If it is iron work necessary for Tramway purposes, they are allowed to work within the Workshop.

Mr. N. Padmanabha Menon.—Does the department claim any remuneration for that?

Mr. K. Govinda Menon.—It is not claiming.

Mr. N. Padmanabha Menon.—Has any instance been brought to the notice of the Tramway Engineer whether the regular coolies employed by the department are helping the contractors in cutting fuel and at the same time drawing their pay from the department?

President.—You mean that our Government—paid coolies are allowed to work for the sake of the contractors, and at the same time they are allowed to draw the pay from the department.

Mr. K. Govinda Menon.—No such things happen.

Mr. N. Padmanabha Menon.—Is there any contractor by the name of Rochy Luis in the Tramway Department?

President.—Why do you bring in names in a discussion? You may as well put in a question, if you want any information on that particular matter.

Mr. N. Padmanabha Menon.—It is not clear from the figures supplied what the actual expenditure is under different heads in the Tramway Department.

President.—Now, the Conservator of Forests is not in a position to furnish the necessary information and all the figures you require. You go on finding fault with the working of the department and the irregularities in it. That is all unfair.

Mr. N. Padmanabha Menon.—I shall try to convince you that the department is working at a loss. I understand that this contractor is aged 80, and is blind, and his son is being employed in the Workshop at Chalakkudi. So the object of giving contracts to the blind old man of 80 is made clear.

President.—You say that the department is working this way and that way. If that is the point, I cannot allow any more discussion on that point.

Mr. N. Padmanabha Menon.—I find provision has been made in the budget for overtime wages. Are these workmen allowed to work on Sundays? It is said that they are asked to work even on His Highness the Maharaja's birthday.

Mr. A. Sankara Puduval.—May I know what the rolling plant and machinery, including engines, are worth roughly now? We spent about 29 lakhs of rupees upon this Tramway. Let me know at least what we would get now, because that is all what we have got now in the Tramway.

President.—What about the Tramway line?

Mr. C. Achyuta Menon.—The railings have to be valued.

Mr. A. Sankara Puduval.—I want to know what they are roughly worth now.

President.—An Engineer cannot give rough figures. The Engineer is supposed to be exact in figures. Now, if they are to give an answer, it will be impossible for them to give the correct amount.

Mr. A. Sankara Puduval.—The amount spent compared with the present value of the old things will be out of proportion, and the figures given here are not at all intelligible.

Mr. A. B. Salem.—What is the consumption of a boiler? How many candies of fuel?

Mr. K. Govinda Menon.—The consumption of fuel is expressed in tons and not in candies.

Mr. A. B. Salem.—Even then I know that $12\frac{1}{2}$ candies make one ton. (*Laughter.*)

President.—Generally, with regard to fuel, we say only so many tons.

Mr. A. B. Salem.—Here we say so many candies, in regard to fuel. What I want to know is the consumption of fuel by an engine. I do not think that all the eight engines work on all days.

Mr. K. Govinda Menon.—That depends upon the nature of the distance run by an engine and the load it carries. With load it would consume more, and without load it would consume less. I think it is about 6 to 8 tons a day for all these engines.

Mr. A. B. Salem.—Do all the engines run together in the same line and at the same time?

President.—These engines will be running in different sections: One engine in the first section goes up and stops. At the second section another engine takes the load and goes up and stops at the third section. Similarly, another engine in the third section goes up and comes down. There are also big inclines in the line. If we have no inclines and all that, we could have a straight line.

Mr. A. B. Salem.—May I know whether in each section only one engine will run at the same time?

Mr. K. Govinda Menon.—In the first section 3 engines, second section 2 and third section 2—altogether seven. Sometimes 3 engines will be running in the first section itself at one and the same time.

Mr. A. B. Salem.—Do all the engines work every day?

Mr. K. Govinda Menon.—No.

Mr. A. B. Salem.—I want to know the consumption of fuel by an engine in each section.

Mr. K. Govinda Menon.—The consumption of an engine will depend upon the working of the engine. It is 8 tons in the first section, $2\frac{1}{2}$ tons in the second section and $3\frac{1}{2}$ tons in the

third section. Supposing you have a very long train, it is divided into 2 parts, and so two engines will have to work.

Mr. A. B. Salem.—I wish to know how many tons you consume every day.

Mr. K. Govinda Menon.—I cannot supply the information at present. I shall supply the information this afternoon.

Mr. A. Sankara Puduval.—If possible, a rough value may be given of the cost of the rolling plant and machinery, including the engines.

President.—Mr. Salem, it seems to me that you do not know the topography of the place. When once you see that, all your doubts will be cleared.

Mr. A. B. Salem.—I think, if a committee is appointed to look into the working of the Tramway Department, I will have a chance of going there. As yet I have not had that chance. (*Laughter.*)

Mr. Chakko Cheruvathur.—May I know the approximate weight, in tons, of fuel supplied by the Forest Department to the Tramway?

Mr. K. Govinda Menon.—It is not supplied in weight. It is supplied in volume. Though it is mentioned as so many tons, a ton does not represent any weight but only 63 c. ft. of volume.

President.—I was under the impression it was weight till now. I think you make no difference whether it is light fuel or dry fuel?

Mr. K. Govinda Menon.—There are certain conditions. The fuel must be of such and such a specie and all that.

Mr. Chakko Cheruvathur.—What is the total cost of fuel supplied by the Forest Department? We find Rs. 10,000 as cost of labour for felling, etc.

Mr. K. Govinda Menon.—I think 4,000 and odd tons is the indented supply for a year, out of which about Rs. 6,000 the Forest Department gets for value of the fuel. The rest goes to the contractor for collection.

Mr. A. Sankara Puduval.—May I know, if this expenditure includes the price of fuel consumed in the line?

Mr. K. Govinda Menon.—As regards the fuel supplied to the Tramway, we get only one-eighth of the price as seigniorage charges.

Mr. A. Sankara Puduval.—That is what is due to the Forest Department. But the fuel has a value of its own.

Mr. K. Govinda Menon.—The Tramway Department pays only seigniorage *plus* collection charges and nothing more.

Mr. A. Sankara Puduval.—May I know approximately what amount of fuel is consumed by the engines throughout the year so that we might ascertain the actual expenditure for the running of the Tramway.

President.—Having regard to seigniorage and the felling charges, and having regard to the market value, can you say what would be the price of fuel consumed by the Tramline in a year?

Mr. K. Govinda Menon.—The only fuel that is marketable is of the first section, and the price is between Rs. 3 and Rs. 4, and the quantity is between 7,000 and 8,000 tons. In the second and the third sections, we cannot put any value, for it would not give any profit, for the charges for bringing the same would come to a good amount. So it is only from the first section you can sell.

President.—But I think the contractors are allowed to cut and bring fuel from all parts of the forest, whether from the first section, second section or the third section?

Mr. K. Govinda Menon.—The contractors can cut fuel from any part of the forest except from the Reserved Forests.

Mr. A. B. Salem.—In the forest the fuel will not cost much. Even if it is one anna, it has its own economic value. How many tons of fuel are consumed altogether by the Tramway in a year?

Mr. K. Govinda Menon.—I think it comes to approximately 4,400 tons, and I think the first section itself consumes more than 2,000 tons.

Mr. C. A. Kunjunni Raja.—Is there any liquor shop in the hills?

President.—I think there is one at the top.

Mr. C. A. Kunjunni Raja.—Could it not be abolished? Generally Kadars are the persons who resort to that.

President.—The fact is that they want it there.

The House then adjourned for lunch and met again at 3 p. m.

Mr. A. B. Salem.—I may be given the details of the overhauling expenditure of Rs. 56,580 for 1099 and 1100.

President.—He says the records are not with him.

Mr. A. B. Salem.—May I know the provision under this head for the ensuing year?

President.—For next year provision is made only for repair works as making of screws, etc., including maintenance.

Mr. A. B. Salem.—I am asking only about overhauling.

Mr. K. Govinda Menon.—It is not a capital work.

President.—It is only a repair work for which Rs. 585 is going to be spent. Let us proceed with the cut motions.

Motions Nos. 58 to 65.

Mr. I. E. Ambooken.—*To reduce the total allotment of Rs. 1,57,300 under "Tramway" by Rs. 25,000.*

Mr. C. N. Ittiravi Nambudiri.—*To reduce the total allotment of Rs. 1,57,300 under "Tramway" by one rupee.*

Mr. S. F. Nunez.—*To reduce the total allotment of Rs. 1,57,300 under "Tramway" by Rs. 7,300.*

Mr. C. A. Ouseph.—*To reduce the total allotment of Rs. 1,57,300 under "Tramway" by Rs. 27,300.*

Mr. T. A. Ramachandra Ayyar.—*To reduce the allotment of Rs. 1,57,300 under "Tramway" by Rs. 1,52,260.*

Mr. K. Sankaran Nambudiri.—*To reduce the total allotment of Rs. 1,57,300 under "Tramway" by Rs. 75,000.*

Mr. E. Ikkanda Wariar.—*To omit the allotment of Rs. 1,57,300 for Tramway.*

Mr. C. A. Kunjunni Raja.—*To omit the allotment of Rs. 1,52,235 for Tramway.*

Mr. I. E. Ambooken.—Sir, before I actually move my motion, I want to raise a point of order. Am I entitled to amend my motion by reducing the amount? If I am entitled, I wish to move for an amendment.

President.—What is it that you want?

Mr. I. E. Ambooken.—I want to make my original motion a token motion of one rupee. Is it not within the rules?

President.—Personally, I have no objection. If it is on a point of principle, I allow it.

Mr. I. E. Ambooken.—The question of Tramway has become an important subject, and after all the discussions in the House in connection with the same, my firm conviction is that most of my friends here have not yet understood any of the details about the working of the department.

President.—It takes a long time to understand these things.

Mr. I. E. Ambooken.—In my opinion, a special committee has to be appointed to enquire into the working of the department and to find out whether any screw is loose so that full satisfaction may be given to the public to justify the retention of this department. Unless this is done, I do not think it is justifiable on the part of the Government to continue its working, on the present basis.

President.—The Special Finance Committee will attend to it.

Mr. I. E. Ambooken.—I think this is a matter which should engage the special attention and scrutiny of a separate committee, and that too without any delay.

President.—Why? Mr. Achyuta Menon has been asked to collect all the figures of the Tramway.

Mr. I. E. Ambooken.—Is he authorised to do it?

Mr. C. Achyuta Menon.—I can promise, on behalf of the Committee, to go into each and every detail as a separate committee is expected to do.

Mr. I. E. Ambooken.—As far as my opinion is concerned it is not sufficient. It would be highly desirable for the Government to appoint a special committee for three or four months to enquire into this subject, as early as possible.

Mr. C. Matthai.—It is within the power of the Special Finance Committee to appoint a sub-committee.

Mr. S. F. Nunez.—The President is entitled to depute some other members to examine this matter. The matter cannot be prolonged any longer. The Government itself has got an idea to stop the working of this department after three or four years.

President.—If everybody wishes it to be stopped, what is to be done?

Mr. I. E. Ambooken.—Perhaps, the Government itself has decided to wind up the department in three or four years. And this has been referred to by the Finance Member also.

President.—I said that we may try for one year.

Mr. I. E. Ambooken.—My point is that the period of its existence may be minimised to one year, if we realise that it is working at a loss.

President.—We have no idea to give it up. It is not a question of domestic concern.

Mr. I. E. Ambooken.—We do not know whether the department is working at a loss or gain. If the House accepts the opinion that there is no need of a special committee, I have no objection at all. Mr. Achyuta Menon thinks that it is not worth stopping.

Mr. C. Achyuta Menon.—Even if it is working at a loss, the question of scrapping is a matter which requires a good deal of consideration. We should do something in the area already tapped. Nothing can be done in this direction without finding some means for transport. All that is possible has to be considered.

President.—This department is not like the Potteries which we were able to close immediately.

Dr. A. R. Menon.—Sir, I rise to oppose the motion. In my opinion, the Special Finance Committee may be divided into special committees to enquire into the various Government Departments and to advise the Government upon the revision of expenditure or any other business connected with it.

Now, from the trend of the discussion raised here, it is clear that the majority of the Members are not in favour of retaining the Tramway. I do not blame them. The Tramway Department has not been able to show profit corresponding to the amount spent in maintaining it, and the revenue from Forest, I believe, in course of time, will be less than what it is today. Unless radical changes are effected, I do not know how far the Tramway Department will be able to stand, without touching the technical side of the question.

The Conservator of Forests said that; out of the whole quantity of timber cut down from our forests, only one-fourth is utilised for the consumption of our people. Supposing we stop this Tramway and do not cut the timber, we will have to get this timber from outside, and the money spent on that will go out of our State. In a matter like this, we must make a differentiation between our territory and another territory. It will be a dead loss to our State, if the exploitation of the forest areas and the working of the Tramway are done away with. How many people are employed in the Tramway Department, and what is their aggregate salary? The expenditure involved for the maintenance of establishment comes to nearly 2½ lakhs of rupees, and our people get this money. Certainly, this money is paid by outsiders, since this timber is not consumed mostly by our people but by others. Therefore, this money in the shape of wages and salaries every year is received by our people. A sudden stoppage of this department will result in depriving the State of a sum of 2½ lakhs. There are people employed by the Railway Department. The Railway Department employ their own men, and our people are not benefited. A differentiation should be made from the case of the Railway, as the money does not go to our people. But in the case of Tramway, this objection does not arise.

Another point we have to consider is the general effect upon the economic problem of our State as a whole by the sudden stoppage of this department. In a commercial concern, there are two important functions to be performed. One is production and the other distribution. For production we require three things. We must have capital, labour and material. For

selling, we must have a wide market for the disposal of our goods. In the case of the Potteries and the Tanneries, the difficulty was that, although we had capital, labour and material, we had no market to dispose of our goods. It is the fault of nobody. The Cochin teak cannot be replaced by Burma teak or any other teak, and the one thing that is lacking in our State is want of timber. We all know that 20 to 30 years are necessary for a tree to grow. The quantity of timber available in our forests is decreasing, and there will not be timber available to meet the demands of the Tramway, and disaster will ensue. My object is to consider the possible ways of developing this line so that the line may work properly. * The Anamalai Estate is very near, and we have there a large quantity of timber and other products.

If we are to arrange to utilise the Tramway line for carrying down the Anamalai products, it will not only give facilities to them, but also we will be in a position to maintain the Tramway Department without loss. The British Government is also likely to construct a line, so far as their area is concerned. By this arrangement the Tramway Department will get ample work, and it will facilitate also the cultivation work of the Anamalai Estates.

Mr. C. Achyuta Menon.—There is a detailed scheme for the extension of the Tramway line to the Anamalai. There is Mr. Bhore's scheme, and this may be placed before the Finance Committee.

President.—It is a confidential document and not intended for publication. Mr. Ambooken, do you press your motion in the light of the remarks made by Dr. A. R. Menon?

Mr. I. E. Ambooken.—May I know, Sir, whether the Government will arrange for a separate committee?

President.—No separate committee for Forest and Tramway is necessary.

Mr. I. E. Ambooken.—I hope it will receive the attention of the Special Finance Committee.

President.—Mr. Achyuta Menon has already replied to it.

Mr. A. B. Salem.—I wish to contribute a few words to this discussion. The Government had assured that the case of a separate committee will be considered before the next grant would be allotted. But I regret to see that 12 months have passed, and no steps have been taken in that direction.

President.—There is a Special Finance Committee.

Mr. A. B. Salem.—The Special Finance Committee is not a panacea for all evils. The Special Finance Committee was appointed merely for the purpose of retrenchment on the lines

suggested by the Hon'ble Member for Mulakunnattukavu who spoke about the necessity for retrenchment. The Finance Committee is purely a Government Committee. The House has been criticising this, and it was the incumbent duty of the Government, after having made a statement in the open Council, to take strong steps to enable the Members of this House or through some such means to give them an insight into the entire working of the Tramway Department. We see here the Head of that Department, and he is not in a position to know the amount of overhauling charges that has been spent during this year. It is a pity that they do not give the information, and I think this is suppressing the real facts.

President.—That is not right. He is not ready; that is all. I object to your expression.

Mr. A. B. Salem.—The gentleman promised before the House that he would place the information during the interval. The interval has passed, and the gentleman says he cannot place it now.

Mr. M. Krishna Menon.—His office is not here, and perhaps it will have to be taken from the records there.

Mr. A. B. Salem.—What does this mean; Sir? When a discussion is taking place inside the House, I expect the Hon'ble Members on the official side to be always ready with their figures. "Our files are not here, our records are not here." These are answers quite out of place in a Council. They should always come prepared with all the information available and necessary for the discussion. I take it that you were good intentioned in asking the Engineer to be present before this House to enlighten us on any point on which we may require information. But what purpose is served by this? Though this procedure was suggested by the President, the Departmental Head was not able to place all the available records before the House. Sir, many promises of a committee were made, and they are all standing unfulfilled. This is a great complaint we have to make. Again, Sir, the Special Finance Committee is absolutely a Government Committee.

Mr. S. F. Nunez.—No, it is not a Government Committee.

Mr. A. B. Salem.—I maintain the statement that it is absolutely a Government Committee.

Mr. S. F. Nunez.—I repudiate it.

President.—You are wrong. It is not a Government Committee. It was appointed by the Government with a non-official majority.

Mr. A. B. Salem.—I mean by "Government Committee" "a Committee appointed by the Government". I did not characterise it as an official committee.

President.—What is the lurking point here ?

Mr. A. B. Salem.—I never made a statement in that sense. I am mentioning the fact that it is a Government Committee, because the members were nominated by the Government, and the House was not asked to select its own Members. If this had been done, it would have been a committee appointed by the House. I do not find fault with the Committee or say that the members appointed are incompetent or anything of that sort. I do not impute any aspersions upon the personnel of the Committee. I mean the members of the Committee are appointed by the Government, and the Government can dissolve it at their will and pleasure. It is a Committee in which the non-official Members have no part in its formation. It is not a Committee in which the House can put its entire confidence. If the Government had nominated its own Members, and the House had been given the choice of selecting its own members, that would have been a representative one. This is the chief complaint.

It does not at all matter to me, if, from the standpoint of the Government, the Tramway is retained. Much money is being spent. We have no voice in the spending of money. It is, in fact, only a nominal business—the whole of the voting of grants. You have got the key with you; you have got the money with you. If you wish, you can spend it. You ask us, "Will you allow us to spend them?" You know you can spend it without asking us. That is the position in which we are placed. We have not got the keys with us, but they are with you. The keys of the Treasury will open only at your bidding. Therefore, I have absolutely no objection, if the Government grants the necessary amount to the Tramway, as they deem fit. Our function is only that of a critic. That is all what I have to say on the subject.

Mr. A. Sankara Puduval.—Sir, in view of the strong criticism that I ventured to offer with regard to the expenditure on Tramway, at the last budget session, I shall make a few observations alone now. It is very gratifying to see that the President himself inspected the locality, and formed his opinion with regard to the future working of the Tramway. The demand of 1,50,000 rupees for the Tramway is simply for its regular working during the year.

The tabulated statement of accounts in Volume I, No. 8, page 620, gives the figures as to how the Tramway was being worked in the past. My friend, the Hon'ble Member for Irinjakkuda, pointed out that the scheme proposed by Mr. Bhore in 1914 might now be abandoned with right. At page 619 of the

Report, we find Mr. Bhole expressing himself in very clear terms, "It (the Forest-Tramway) has been, for some years, recognised as a difficult question, and has caused much anxiety; but it is now reaching an acute stage and calls for a solution more insistently.....In 1882, the Tramway was opened for transport. At the end of 1888 the capital and recurring expenditure on the Tramway stood at Rs. 28,17,962, while the total value of the forest produce carried by the Tramway, after deducting the incidental charges of felling, loading, etc., of timber at the end of that time, amounted to Rs. 14,87,826. At the ordinary rate of working, the more valuable timber, which alone it can pay to transport by the Tramway, will be exhausted in about four years more, probably by the end of 1893, and it is patent that no other rate of working, unless it be heavier exploitation, will pay, considering the large running expenses of the Tramway. On the other hand, the carrying capacity of the Tramway limits the rate of working. ...The total expenditure on Tramway, both for capital and recurring charges, and the total value of the forest produce carried by the Tramway, deducting incidental collection charges from 1882 to 1893, —when, under ordinary circumstances, the Tramway would cease to work—would roughly amount to 34 and 26 lakhs of rupees, respectively, in rough figures. Thus, the net result, so far as can be seen at present, will be the total depletion of the State's existing stock of valuable teak and rose-wood, in the area served by the Tramway, at a large cost to this State; in other words, the State will have had to pay for destroying its valuable timber in this area. The Tramway's future presents a problem of no little difficulty."

Now, this experiment has been tried, and Mr. Bhole made his proposals in 1914, and 12 years have now rolled on. I do not think it would be worth while to take this suggestion once again into serious consideration. The observations made by the Hon'ble Member for Mulakunnattukavu seem to be very pertinent. If we finish felling the trees, carting the logs and thus compute the operations within a period of about 18 months, we shall in all probability make a profit of three lakhs, and I think that the Finance Committee will consider the question. The Diwan has proposed to give it a trial for one year more. Now, within this one year, there will be hardly time for either the Finance Committee or a sub-committee formed by the Finance Committee to go into the question. We have to make up our minds now once for all. Either wait till the Finance Committee submits in its Report or accept the suggestions made by the Hon'ble Member for Mulakunnattukavu, work up the Tramway,

and finish it in 18 months. It would be undesirable that we allow things to go on in this fashion. Operations are now proposed to be carried on in the unexploited portion of the forests for another year more. That would bring great loss to the State. If we delay, and if we want to await the Report of the Special Finance Committee, and in the meantime allow it to be worked on very similar lines for one year more, we shall be considerable losers by the venture. So that we are between the two horns of a dilemma. The Diwan himself may be pleased to reconsider the opinions that he has formed in the matter, and make up his mind either to accept the suggestion brought forward by the Hon'ble Member for Mulakunnattukavu to finish the exploitation of the remaining area within a period of 18 months or to stop the business entirely. If either of these courses be not adopted, substantial pecuniary loss is certain. There is no need to appoint any committee to consider this question. Instead of stopping the Tramway in 1903, we carried on the operations, with the result that we lost another 8 lakhs more. That is, because the work was not carried on on the lines originally proposed. There was much slackness in the work, which brought about a great deal of loss incidentally.

Let us not, therefore, waste any more time in dubious anxiety, and in the light of past experience, arrive at a definite course of action; either end it altogether or try to make the best of it by working it vigorously for the next eighteen months. (*Hear, hear.*)

Mr. S. F. Nunez.—In the light of the discussion that has already been carried on in this House, I do not mean to move my motion. The subject is so very obscure. The details necessary are wanting, and I am afraid that the Member for Irinjalakkuda touched on the real economic question. Now, the question is not merely of expenditure and income. That should be the last factor in the solution of a wider problem. We have to consider the question of timber supply. That could not be effected by the immediate suppression of the Tramway. Considerable difficulty would be experienced in regard to the supply of timber for building purposes for which plenty of timber is required. If we suppress the Tramway, the supply of timber from Forests, as another Member suggested, will automatically cease to exist, and we will have to depend upon foreign imports. It would double and treble the prices, and seriously handicap our building operations.

There is another aspect which will result with the suppression of the Tramway, which I am very sorry the House has not taken into account. We have employed a number of hands

in the Tramway. Several of them are underpaid. There is no pension for them. There is no provision for Provident Fund. They are like gally slaves. If we are going to stop the working of the Tramway this year, it is not because the work of these people was lacking in any matter, but it is because of the ruinous policy pursued by the Forest Department from the very beginning.

President.—400 people will have to be thrown out of employment.

Mr. S. F. Nunez.—Well, in these days of unemployment, some States are embarking upon the new schemes. If we are going to suppress the Tramway, I do not know how or where they are going to be absorbed.

Mr. Chakko Cheruvathur.—They will be provided for elsewhere.

Mr. S. F. Nunez.—Where is this "elsewhere"? It is not enough, if we build upon foundations of sand, but we should have some concrete data to proceed. For this the Special Finance Committee should depute a sub-committee immediately who can go into the working of the Tramway and see how far the Tramway can be made to work. If not profitable, it should be worked at least for the higher interests of the people at large. The employees would be absorbed in some other place. These are the higher economic questions, and the Government as well as this House should realise these questions. The Finance Committee, I hope, would be immediately appointed to facilitate the conduct of the investigations and to submit a report within a few months or at least before the coming budget session. When the House will have facts and figures as to the failure involved in these two departments, then we shall be able to pass a judgment which could not do any injury or which could not be against the interests of the State.

Dr. A. R. Menon.—600 people are employed in cutting the trees, though not directly under the Government.

Mr. T. A. Ramachandra Ayyar.—When I sent this cut motion, I was for abolishing the Tramway even from to-day. I take it that the Conservator of Forests assures this House that the Tramway is entirely responsible for the sum of 3 and odd lakhs shown against "Timber and other produce removed by Sirkar agency," and that the Forest Department would not be able to get any portion of that amount, if the Tramway is abolished. In other words, he wants to view the Forest and Tramway as one department. As matters now stand, it would appear that, without the Tramway, the Forest Department would work at a loss after destroying much valuable timber.

With the Tramway amalgamated with the Forest Department, it appears to work with a profit of one lakh and odd. (I, therefore, withdraw my cut). But before concluding, I have to remark that there is a popular belief, I think, which was endorsed by the President that the Tramway would get sufficient timber for another three years.

President.—No, I did not say so. It is the Conservator of Forests who held out an assurance that we can successfully work for another three years.

Mr. C. Achyuta Menon.—At the rate of 21,000 candies a year.

Mr. T. A. Ramachandra Ayyar.—Does not matter. However, it will not be very long before this House will be called upon to sound the death-knell of the Forest and Tram Departments.

President.—How?

Mr. T. A. Ramachandra Ayyar.—If the Tramway is abolished, then the Forest Department should also automatically cease to exist. But I hope by that time (i. e. three years) the present Conservator will be a non-official Member sitting on this side of the House.

President.—How?

Mr. T. A. Ramachandra Ayyar.—After two or three years it will be time for him to retire.

I believe the Hon'ble Member for the Planters would be able to give us some information whether the Planters of Anamalai or of some other plantations could come to our rescue and feed the Tram after three years.

Mr. H. J. Walmesly.—I am opposed to the closing of the Tramway at the present time, and I think we should wait until arrangements regarding the proposed Anamalai—Chalakudi Railway have been settled. I am not quite certain about the present position regarding this Railway, but I can tell you that the Anamalai planters have guaranteed Rs. 75,000 for a survey of the Railway, and have also offered to finance it, if necessary.

It appears to me to be a great mistake to talk of closing the Tramway at the present time, when we know it can be run at a small profit for two years, and should we close it, we not only throw a large number of people out of employment, but destroy what may possibly be an asset, should the Anamalais—Chalakudi Railway be constructed in the near future.

I cannot say whether the proposed Railway will follow approximately the present trace or not, but I am absolutely certain that the Anamalai district will have to find some new outlet

for its produce, and the most natural one would appear to be to lie in a more or less direct Railway to Cochin.

Mr. E. Ikkanda Wariar.—I do not wish to press the motion.

Mr. C. A. Kunjunny Raja.—I don't press the motion.

President.—I must ask Mr. Ambooken whether he desires to press his motion to a division.

Mr. I. E. Ambooken.—When can we expect the Report of the Finance Committee regarding the subject?

President.—An assurance cannot be held out. They will make a *bona fide* attempt. The Report will reach us at least before the next budget session. They will try to do their best and expedite their Report.

Mr. I. E. Ambooken.—Anyhow, their special attention should be paid to the matter. Believing that, I withdraw this motion. None of the other motions being pressed, the demand was put to votes and carried.

Demand XI.—Registration.—Rs. 43 lakh.

Mr. A. K. Vengu Ayyar.—Sir, I rise to move for a grant of Rs. 43,036 under XI—Registration. This is in excess of the budget estimate of the current year by over Rs. 600, but falls short of the revised estimate by Rs. 2,402. The excess of Rs. 600 is accounted for by the provisions under "Temporary Establishment", "Contingencies", and "Miscellaneous". The excess allotment of Rs. 280 under the former head is due to the fact that provision has been made for the continuance of a temporary clerk on Rs. 20 for the Vellarappalli Registry Office for the whole of the next year and also for the entertainment from 1st Chingam 1102 of another clerk on the same pay in the Vadakkumkara Registry Office. It has already been brought to the notice of this House on a previous occasion that the present staff in these offices is not able to cope with the increased work there. As the work shows no abatement, their continuance has become an imperative necessity.

The other item of increase which calls for an explanation is "Miscellaneous." The excess of Rs. 400 over the demand of the current year is due to the provision for a Remington Typewriter, the cost of which will approximately come to that amount. It is nearly 12 years since a machine has been supplied to the Registration Superintendent's Office. The present one is damaged beyond repair.

Motions Nos. 66 and 67.

Mr. C. N. Ittiravi Nambudiri.—*To reduce the total allotment of Rs. 68,700 under "Registration" by one rupee.*

Mr. A. B. Salem.—*To reduce the total allotment of Rs. 68,700 under "Registration" by one rupee.*

പ്രസിഡൻഷ്.—മിസ്റ്റർ ഇട്ടിരവി നമ്പൂതിരി ഒരു രൂപയ്ക്കു ഒരു (ട്രോക്കർ)മോഷൻ കൊണ്ടുവന്നത് എന്തിനെ ഉദ്ദേശിച്ചാണ്.

മിസ്റ്റർ സി. എൻ. ഇട്ടിരവി നമ്പൂതിരി.—ഒരു റജിസ്റ്റർ കച്ചേരിയുടെ അതൃത്തിമാറ്റത്തെ സംബന്ധിച്ച് ചില ആക്ഷേപങ്ങൾ ഗവണ്മെന്റിന്റെ ഓഫീസിൽ കൊണ്ടുവരാനാണ് ഞാൻ ഇത് അയച്ചിട്ടുള്ളത്.

ഏനാമാക്കൽ റജിസ്റ്റർ കച്ചേരിയുടെ അതൃത്തിയിൽ പെട്ടിരുന്നതായ രണ്ടു വില്ലേജുകൾ കാട്ടൂർ റജിസ്റ്റർ ഓഫീസ് അതൃത്തിയിലേയ്ക്ക് മാറ്റുകയുണ്ടായി.

പ്രസിഡൻഷ്.—ഏതെല്ലാം വില്ലേജുകളാണ്?

മിസ്റ്റർ സി. എൻ. ഇട്ടിരവി നമ്പൂതിരി.—കുമ്പിലാമുകിപ്പിള്ളിക്കരയും. വർഷക്കാലത്തു് വെള്ളം പൊങ്ങുമ്പോൾ ഈ വില്ലേജുകളിൽ ഉള്ളവർക്കു ഒരു പുഴകടന്നുവേണാ കാട്ടൂർ കച്ചേരിക്ക് പോകാൻ. അതു വളരെ വിഷമവും ബുദ്ധിമുട്ടും ഉള്ളതാണ്.

പ്രസിഡൻഷ്.—വെള്ളം ഇല്ലാത്ത കാലത്തോ?

മിസ്റ്റർ സി. എൻ. ഇട്ടിരവി നമ്പൂതിരി.—വെള്ളം ഇല്ലാത്തകാലത്തു ബുദ്ധിമുട്ടുകാതെ പോകാം. എങ്കിലും ഏനാമാക്കൽ പോകാൻ സൗകര്യമായ റോഡുണ്ട്. അത് എല്ലാകാലത്തും ഒരുപോലെ ഗതാഗതത്തിന് പ്രയോജനപ്പെടുന്നതാണ്. അവർ ഈ അതൃത്തിമാറ്റത്തെപ്പറ്റി സങ്കടങ്ങൾ ബോധിപ്പിച്ചിട്ടുണ്ട്. എന്നാൽ യാതൊരു നിവൃത്തിയും ഉണ്ടായിട്ടില്ല.

പ്രസിഡൻഷ്.—അവർക്കെല്ലാം ഏനാമാക്കൽ പോകാനാണോ ആഗ്രഹം?

മിസ്റ്റർ സി. എൻ. ഇട്ടിരവി നമ്പൂതിരി.—അതെ.

പ്രസിഡൻഷ്.—രണ്ടു കക്ഷികളിലെ സാധാരണ ഇങ്ങനെയുള്ള കാര്യങ്ങൾക്ക് രണ്ടു കക്ഷി ഉണ്ടാവുക പതിവാണ്.

മിസ്റ്റർ സി. എൻ. ഇട്ടിരവി നമ്പൂതിരി.—അതു നല്ല നിശ്ചയമില്ല.

President.—Was this question investigated at any time?

Mr. A. K. Vengu Ayyar.—No, Sir.

പ്രസിഡൻഷ്.—അതിനേപ്പറ്റി ഹർജി കളൊന്നും ഉണ്ടായിട്ടില്ലെന്നാണ് പറയുന്നത്.

മിസ്റ്റർ സി. എൻ. ഇട്ടിരവി നമ്പൂതിരി.—അയച്ചിട്ടുണ്ടായിരുന്നു മറുപടി ഒന്നും കിട്ടിയില്ലെന്നു ഉള്ളൂ.

പ്രസിഡൻഷ്.—ഇനി അതിനേപ്പറ്റി ആലോചിക്കാം.

മിസ്റ്റർ എ. കെ. തോമ.—കാട്ടൂർ റജിസ്ട്രാപ്പീസ് സ്ഥാപിച്ചപ്പോൾ തന്നെ ഈ വില്ലേജുകൾ മാറ്റി ഉൾപ്പെടുത്തുകയുണ്ടായി.

പ്രസിഡൻഷ്.—അങ്ങനെ ചെയ്തതുകൊണ്ട് അവർക്ക് സങ്കടമുണ്ടോ എന്നാണ് ചോദിക്കുന്നത്?

മിസ്റ്റർ എ. കെ. തോമ. — അക്കാലത്തൊന്നും വലിയ സങ്കടങ്ങൾ ഉള്ളതായി കേട്ടിട്ടില്ല. അവർക്ക് എന്നാമാക്കലേക്കാൾ വഴി എടുപ്പവും അടുപ്പവും കാട്ടാൻ തന്നെയാണ്.

മിസ്റ്റർ സി. എൻ. ഇട്ടിരവി നമ്പൂതിരി. — വില്ലേജുകൾ അടുത്താണ്. എപ്പോഴും കടവുകടന്നുപോകാൻ എടുപ്പമില്ല.

മിസ്റ്റർ എ. കെ. തോമ. — ശരിയാണ്. എല്ലാകാലവും വഴി ഒരുപോലെ അല്ല. മഴക്കാലത്ത് കുറെ അലോഗ്യമുണ്ട്. പക്ഷെ, സൗകാര്യം അതാണ്.

പ്രസിഡെണ്ട്. — എല്ലാകാലത്തും അലോഗ്യമില്ലല്ലോ?

മിസ്റ്റർ എ. കെ. തോമ. — വലിയ സുഖക്കേട് ഒന്നും ഇല്ലാത്തവരാണെങ്കിൽ വഞ്ചിക്കുവരാൻ എടുപ്പമുണ്ട്.

പ്രസിഡെണ്ട്. — ആലോചിക്കാം. ഇപ്പോൾ ഈ മോഷൻ ഇവിടെ ഹാജരാക്കുന്നുണ്ടോ?

മിസ്റ്റർ സി. എൻ. ഇട്ടിരവി നമ്പൂതിരി. — ഇല്ല. ഞാൻ ഇത്രയും പറയാൻ മാത്രമായിട്ടാണ് ഇത് കൊണ്ടുവന്നിട്ടുള്ളത്.

The motion, not being moved, was deemed withdrawn.

President. Was any petition received in the matter?

Mr. A. K. Vengu Ayyar. — When the Kattur Registry Office was opened, then it was that these two villages were added. No petitions were received.

Mr. A. B. Salem. — I wanted to bring to the notice of this House the suggestion whether it could not be possible to club Registration with Anchal, after the present incumbents' term of office comes to a close. These are minor departments. They cannot entail very heavy work upon the Heads of the Departments.

President. — The question is one which has been under consideration for some time.

Mr. A. B. Salem. — I am very glad.

Mr. Chakko Cheruvathur. — May I know whether the Government has addressed the Superintendent of Registration for the refunds occasionally seen published in the Gazette? The Kunnamkulam Registrar should be asked to refund the excess amounts to the parties who have gone away, and months have passed. After a certain period of the notification in the Gazette, these amounts will lapse to the Sirkar.

President. — We have issued notifications that the refunds should be made. Last year there was a discussion on this, and we have issued orders.

Mr. A. K. Vengu Ayyar. — I think we have issued orders that the refunds should be made to parties.

Mr. A. B. Salem did not move his motion.

The Demand was then put to votes and carried.

Demand XII—Anchal—Rs. 62 lakh.

Mr. A. K. Vengu Ayyar—Sir, I rise to move for a grant of Rs. 62,271 under XII—Anchal, for 1102. A glance at the figures will show that there is no striking variation. The slight increase under "Temporary Establishment", as compared with the revised estimate, is due to the fact that two temporary Anchal Offices sanctioned under the guarantee system were not actually working in 1100. They may begin work next year. The additional provision of Rs. 400 under "Railway train" for carrying mails is due to the increased rate in trainage.

President.—The Standing Finance Committee made reference to peons.

Mr. A. K. Vengu Ayyar.—They are ordinary mail carriers and delivery peons. Their pay is less. They are not really boys. One is under the Panchayat. Their function is carrying mails to the Anchal Office and delivering from Malayattur and Koratti. The Malayattur peon has to carry mail to the Kaladi Anchal Office, a distance of about 3 and a half miles.

President.—That is not within our jurisdiction. Why should we bother about Kaladi?

Mr. A. K. Vengu Ayyar.—We have to carry the same in Travancore to Koratti and mails from Adur and back. They have also got to attend to delivery work. Their pay is less than that of the ordinary runners. Their security also is less than that of others.

Motions Nos. 68—72.

Mr. S. F. Nunez.—*To reduce the allotment of Rs. 22,000 for cost of Anchal and service stamps by Rs. 2,000.*

Mr. E. Ikkanda Wariar.—*To reduce the total allotment of Rs. 69,300 under "Anchal" by one rupee.*

Mr. C. A. Kunjunni Raja.—*To reduce the total allotment of Rs. 69,300 under "Anchal" by one rupee.*

Mr. C. A. Ouseph.—*To reduce the total allotment of Rs. 69,300 under "Anchal" by one rupee.*

Mr. A. B. Salem.—*To reduce the total allotment of Rs. 69,300 under "Anchal" by one rupee.*

President.—No. 69, Mr. Ikkanda Wariar.

Mr. E. Ikkanda Wariar.—I do not press that motion.

President.—Then, No. 70, Mr. C. A. Kunjunni Raja.

Mr. C. A. Kunjunni Raja.—My object is to draw the attention of the Government to the undesirability of transferring these peons every now and then. The moment a peon gets accustomed to the locality, he is transferred. I do not know why that is necessary. It is only for this purpose that I have brought this cut motion.

President—Is there any complaint regarding these transfers?

M. A. K. Vengu Ayyar.—No serious complaints.

Mr. C. Achyuta Menon.—There is no likelihood of these poor peons complaining to the Head of the Department.

Mr. M. Krishna Menon.—Even now, they have no complaints. It is the complaint of the public.

President.—Any how, note it, and issue orders that these peons need not be transferred unnecessarily.

Mr. A. K. Vengu Ayyar.—Yes, Sir.

Mr. T. A. Ramachandra Ayyar.—I want to know to whom this "commission on sale of Anchal stamps"—Rs. 2,050—is paid. I want to know why it is made non-votable and to whom it goes.

Mr. A. K. Vengu Ayyar.—It goes to the Anchal Masters.

Mr. T. A. Ramachandra Ayyar.—These Anchal Masters are paid, I think, by the Government. It is their duty to sell the stamps. Why should then the commission be paid?

President—They are paid for their service, and not for the sale of stamps.

Mr. T. A. Ramachandra Ayyar.—They may be paid one or two rupees more. Why should this commission be paid? Why should it be made non-votable?

President.—Under the Anchal Regulation, they are entitled to this.

Dr. A. R. Menon.—In British service also the Post Masters get commission.

Diwan Bahadur Dr. V. Verghese.—They do not get commission. No, they do not get. That is stopped.

President.—Do they give anything by way of compensation? Did the Government become a gainer or loser by this?

Mr. Sheik Abdul Qadir Sahib Bahadur.—Very probably, a loss.

Mr. C. Achyuta Menon.—Loser, so much so that they raised the price of stamps 100%. The pay was raised on an average of 75%.

President.—But does this engage the attention of the Special Finance Committee? Do they deal with this suggestion to increase the pay?

Mr. C. Achyuta Menon.—We have not come to it.

Mr. T. A. Ramachandra Ayyar.—How is it non-votable? Railway freight, carrying mails, weights, etc., these also are non-votable.

President.—We are bound to pay the expenditure for mails. We have to pay 6 pies per mile. Does it come under the Regulation?

Mr. C. A. Kunjunni Raja.—It is only a payment for services rendered. It is not an expenditure obligatory under any law. I raise that it is a votable item.

Mr. C. Achyuta Menon.—It was put in italics, because the word 'Railway' came there. (*Laughter.*)

Dr. A. R. Menon.—Yes.

President.—We have to pay the Railway authorities for carrying our Anchals. It is a contract.

Mr. C. A. Kunjunni Raja.—It is not put as non-votable.

President.—The Special Finance Committee will consider it.

Mr. C. A. Kunjunni Raja.—This is not an obligatory payment.

President.—There is no objection to this under section 16 (4). It is votable. What is it there in Travancore? Have they put this as non-votable?

Mr. C. Achyuta Menon.—In the accounts for 1100, the amount is 2,066. Next year it is only 1,400. Well, that increase was due to the fact that mails were carried by the boat.

President.—This year also it is the same amount, I think.

Mr. C. Achyuta Menon.—Even that is in italics.

President.—Sometimes, they increase the rates. They wanted a larger rate, and we were obliged to pay. In 1100 they raised it from 4 pies to 6 pies. Is there any real objection to treat it as votable?

Mr. K. Achyuta Menon.—At present, I don't find any objection.

President.—This may be noted, so that next year it may not be treated as non-votable.

Mr. C. A. Ouseph is absent. Next comes Mr. A. B. Salem's token motion.

Mr. A. B. Salem.—Sir, I have tabled this motion to draw your attention to page 40. There are 13 Branch Anchal Masters, of whom, I find, 11 draw a salary of Rs. 5 a month. We spend Rs. 3 or Rs. 4 upon a head of cattle in the Central Farm at Ollukkara. I do not know why such a small payment is made to an Anchal Master.

President.—Branch Anchal Master?

Mr. A. B. Salem.—Yes, Sir.

Mr. C. Achyuta Menon.—They are schoolmasters.

President.—How many of them?

Mr. A. B. Salem.—11 of them at Rs. 5.

Mr. A. K. Vengu Ayyar.—They are *ex-officio*, because they have got other work to do. It is only in Branch Anchal Offices.

President.—Some extra they get.

Mr. A. B. Salem.—I want to know whether they are schoolmasters or clerks.

President.—Is it so, Mr. Matthai? Are there any schoolmasters doing Anchal Office work?

Mr. C. Matthai.—Yes, Sir; a few of them are.

President.—Aided schoolmasters or Government schoolmasters?

Mr. C. Matthai.—Mostly aided, some Government. I remember, Sir, two days back, I had an application from an aided school teacher, but then I sent it back to the Manager of the school to know whether he has any objection. The Manager wrote that he is already the Secretary of C. Y. M. A. or something else. Unless he resigned one of these, we could not allow him.

President.—Do you not think it is good for teachers to be appointed as Anchal Masters also?

Mr. C. Matthai.—Provided they do justice to the other work, I have no objection at all. Suppose he has to attend to delivery and so on during class hours. That is objectionable.

President.—But no complaint has reached your ears that, by being Anchal Masters, they have neglected their other duty?

Mr. C. Matthai.—I think, once or twice, I had complaints. And then I asked the teacher to resign his Anchalmastership.

Mr. C. Achyuta Menon.—We had adopted that practice from the British system, of giving them two duties. When this was first proposed, the understanding was that, only in such Anchal Offices in which the mail is received or sent either in the morning or in the evening after school hours, schoolmasters are to be appointed. I don't know whether that practice is rigidly adhered to.

Mr. A. B. Salem.—If that is so, Sir, then, I think the allowance or commission should never be interfered with. It is a small income that they are getting for this work. The suggestion was that, as in British Post offices, the commission on the sale of Anchal stamps should be stopped.

President.—The commission will be stopped only on condition that they are given an increase of pay. Do not take the commission and leave the pay as it is.

Mr. A. B. Salem.—Exactly.

Another thing that I wish to bring to your notice is the allowance for the Anchal peons in the towns who do as much work as the Postal peons. I find many peons, letter box peons, mail peons, boy peons. You find that their pay is very small—Rs. 9 or Rs. 6.

Mr. A. K. Vengu Ayyar.—But these boy peons have got very little work.

Mr. A. B. Salem.—I say we have got 5 mail peons on Rs. 9.

President.—But do they not come under low-paid servants?

Mr. A. B. Salem.—May be, Sir. I wanted to draw attention to their pay.

President.—The case of low-paid servants of all the departments will be enquired into.

Mr. A. B. Salem.—The Postal peons draw 17, 20, 25 rupees, etc., even in Ernakulam.

Mr. M. Krishna Menon.—Rs. 19.

Mr. A. B. Salem.—Our peons and their peons do exactly the same amount of work.

Mr. M. Krishna Menon.—More on some dates.

Mr. A. B. Salem.—To pay them Rs. 9 till the Finance Committee submits its Report is very hard. At least, some temporary relief should be given.

President.—It may be noted by the Special Finance Committee.

Mr. A. B. Salem.—I cannot propose an appropriation of a few rupees more. Otherwise, I would have done it this year.

President.—Have you done with all the cut motions?

Mr. T. K. Krishna Menon.—Yes, Sir.

The question of granting '69 lakh under Demand No. XII—Anchal, was put to votes and carried.

President.—The next Demand is No. XIII—'General Administration.'

Demand XIII—General Administration—Rs. '62 lakh.

Mr. A. K. Vengu Ayyar.—Sir, I rise to move for a grant of Rs. 62,268 under XIII—"General Administration". Provision has been made only for the minimum requirements of the coming year. The details of expenditure under the head are given in the printed budget, and it may be observed that the provisions made under most of the sub-heads are almost the same as those of the previous year, and in some cases even less. Still there is a slight increase of Rs. 397 in the total demand for 1902. This is due to the fact that a new sub-head, called "the Special Finance Committee" has been opened under "Huzur

Secretariat" and a lump sum of Rs. 1,000 provided under it towards the expenditure on account of the Committee. This expenditure has been proposed to be debited to "General Administration", in view of the general character of the Committee.

In regard to the "Legislative Council" the demand for 1926 is less than that of the current year, even though increased provision had to be made under the sub-heads, travelling allowance, and bonus to reporters. Under T. A. there is an increase of Rs. 500 over that of the current year, due to the enhanced rates of the travelling allowance allowed to the non-official Members. For bonus to reporters, a sum of Rs. 600 is provided. We have not appointed permanent reporters to the Council. Reporters are engaged during Council session, and they are given a bonus at the rate of Rs. 150 for each sitting. This arrangement is found to work satisfactorily, and is at the same time a gain to the Government. During the current year, this expenditure is provided under the sub-head "Miscellaneous", but since it has been fixed in the course of the year, it is exhibited under a separate sub-head in the budget. The provisions under the other sub-heads call for no remarks. In the result, there is only a net increase of Rs. 397 in the total Demand, and I request that the House will be pleased to grant the Demand.

Motion No. 73.

Mr. A. B. SALEM.—*To reduce the allotment of Rs. 75 to 100 for the Diwan's confidential clerk by one rupee.*

President.—What is the point that you want? You want some information about the confidential clerk.

Mr. A. K. Veugu Ayyar.—I have it ready.

President.—The nature of the work that he does, i. e., the confidential clerk—is it that what you want?

Mr. A. B. Salem.—No, Sir. I have asked for certain information from the Secretary.

President.—What is the information that you want? Do you want for reference this motion slip you sent to the Council Secretary?

Mr. C. Achyuta Menon.—He has forgotten what the motion was for. (*Laughter.*)

Mr. A. B. Salem.—I want to know what amounts have been donated to Clubs outside Cochin during the last 5 years and the purpose for which they were made? That is, to know what amounts have been contributed to Clubs outside Cochin during the last 5 years, and whether contributions were made for State guests, and the names of guests that were entertained during the year.

President.—Is that the information you want?

Mr. C. Achyuta Menon.—There are two sub-heads.—“Miscellaneous subscriptions and donations”, and “Entertainment of State guests.” The cut should come under Demand XXXI—“Miscellaneous”.

President.—I thought it was to know something about the confidential clerk. Of course, all these matters you may know by putting questions. The confidential clerk has nothing to do with these.

Mr. M. Krishna Menon.—Accidentally, it fell on the clerk. (*Laughter.*)

President.—You want to know what amounts have been contributed to Clubs outside Cochin during the last five years and to whom such contributions were made?

Mr. A. K. Vengu Ayyar.—I shall try to give some information.

President.—Why not you put it in the form of questions and answers, instead of asking it in a budget token motion? It is not a question of principle or policy to be discussed now. Now, you will want figures.

Mr. A. B. Salem.—I am raising a question of policy. I want to know what has been actually spent.

President.—That information has not been collected?

Mr. A. K. Vengu Ayyar.—Some information is here. To the Madras Race Club in 1097, we have paid Rs. 500. In 1098 we paid nothing; in 1099 we paid Rs. 500, and in 1100, Rs. 500. This year also we paid Rs. 500. Then to the South India Rifle Association, Bangalore, we pay Rs. 100 every year. For the Ladies' Recreation Club, Madras, in 1099, Rs. 10,000 was donated. Regarding these and the entertainment of State guests, the information cannot be supplied, as the items are non-votable.

Mr. A. B. Salem.—I only wanted to know the names and the amount spent.

President.—What policy have you to discuss in connection with the entertainment of State guests?

Mr. A. B. Salem.—Why is it non-votable?

Mr. A. K. Vengu Ayyar.—Because it comes under political matters.

Mr. C. A. Kunjunni Raja.—It had not been classified under “Political”.

Mr. A. K. Vengu Ayyar.—Entertainment of State guests comes under political matters.

Mr. C. Achyuta Menon.—No State guest can be entertained without His Highness' sanction. State guests are His Highness' guests. Any expenditure incurred on behalf of His Highness is non-votable.

Mr. C. A. Kunjunni Raja.—But, that is not political.

Mr. C. Achyuta Menon.—Doubtful.

Mr. K. Achyuta Menon.—Under section 16 (4) (vii).

Mr. A. K. Vengu Ayyar.—Exactly.

President.—The only objection is it had not been classified. The Finance Committee has classified that.

Mr. C. A. Kunjunni Raja.—It has not been classified, Sir.

President.—I think, steps are being taken for classifying it as such.

Mr. A. K. Vengu Ayyar.—Yes, Sir.

Mr. C. Achyuta Menon.—Is the travelling allowance of the official members of the Special Finance Committee debited to this Head?

Mr. A. K. Vengu Ayyar.—Yes.

Mr. C. Achyuta Menon.—Of official members?

Mr. A. K. Vengu Ayyar.—No, not of official members. It is according to rules debited to their departments.

Mr. C. Achyuta Menon.—Otherwise the amount may not be sufficient.

President.—Have you any point to be raised, Mr. Salem, in connection with motion No. 73?

Mr. A. B. Salem.—Yes, Sir. We have come to know that a large sum of money, about 10,000 rupees, has been spent out for a Club with which we have absolutely no concern. And I wanted to know the information, so that such an expenditure may not recur in future. I don't want to go into the details of that contribution. I leave it to the Government to justify that contribution in their reply. Clubs exist outside for the benefit of those who are resident outside, and for the members thereof. What have we to do with them? If any of our Cochin subjects are resident there or have got something to do with that Club, they may subscribe for it. Otherwise, such an expenditure must be well scrutinised. That policy should be revised. Of course, no one knows about these things. Nobody can know these things. Now that we have a Council, we get some information that such an amount has been contributed by Cochin. The people of Cochin never knew anything about it. At least I did not know about it. I got the information from Madras.

President.—We pay something to the Pasteur Institute.

Mr. A. K. Vengu Ayyar.—Yes, to the Pasteur Institute.

Mr. A. B. Salem.—We have got some information.

Mr. A. K. Vengu Ayyar.—It comes under "Miscellaneous contributions and donations". The donation has been made

with His Highness' sanction. I doubt whether it is subject to question by this Council.

Mr. C. Achyuta Menon.—“Miscellaneous subscriptions and donations”. The contribution is made in His Highness' name and not in the name of the Government. It is His Highness' privilege and done under His Highness' command. Not a single pie has been spent under any other head.

President.—These are done with His Highness' sanction.

Motions Nos. 74—78.

Mr. K. T. Mathew.—*To reduce the allotment of Rs. 35,380 for “Huzur Establishment” including Diwan's Personal Staff by Rs. 100.*

Mr. A. B. Salem.—*To reduce the allotment of Rs. 35,380 for “Huzur Establishment” by one rupee.*

Mr. Poullo Mampilli.—*To reduce the total allotment of Rs. 74,348 under “Huzur Secretariat” by Rs. 100.*

Mr. K. T. Mathew.—*To reduce the allotment of Rs. 74,348 for “Huzur Secretariat” by Rs. 100.*

Dr. A. R. Menon.—*To reduce the total allotment of Rs. 74,348 under “Huzur Secretariat” by one rupee.*

Mr. K. T. Mathew.—Sir, this motion is to bring to the attention of the Government the necessity of appointing a Staff Selection Board. I had a few words to speak on this subject some days before, but as the President then said that it would be more appropriate to discuss this subject under “General Administration,” I am now taking up this subject for discussion.

In answer to a question which I put regarding the appointment of a Staff Selection Board, the Government said that there is not sufficient reason for appointing a Staff Selection Board. I pointed out the other day that, even among the officials, there is some discontent on account of the method of recruitments now employed by the Government. At the Head-masters' Conferance, a resolution was passed to this effect, that a Board should be appointed for selecting candidates for appointments in the Education Department. Non-official Members of this Council have, on more than one occasion, pointed out the necessity of appointing a Staff Selection Board. They have clearly stated that there is discontent among the officials and the public on account of the present method. To fortify my statement, let me quote what some of the Members of this House have observed.

The Hon'able Member for Irinjalakkuda said: “This question of appointments is one which has done immense mischief in the State, and is calculated to produce much irritation in this House, unless some sound principles were adopted and

observed scrupulously by the Government. It is because of the belief generally prevalent among the public that the Government is not guided by any high and sound principle in this matter that this House is called upon to discuss their action in the question of appointments."

I had occasion to point out, Sir, that the policy which is being followed by the Government in recruiting candidates to the Government service has created discontent in the State. "Not only one community, perhaps, all the communities in the State look with great dissatisfaction upon the policy of recruitment followed by the Government. There is no use of saying that there is no reasonable discontent, as the Government puts it, when discontent actually prevails.

"The Government should make honest attempts to see whether there are capable hands available in our State. The present policy of filling up new posts does not enable the Government to say whether there are capable Cochinites available. Advertisement is an absolute necessity, and there should be a Board of Selection. The non-official Members of this Council should be given representation on this Board. The Heads of Departments or the Diwan should not be the sole authority. The power entrusted to them till now they have not utilised to the satisfaction of the people in general. This was due to their direct fault or to some extraneous circumstances over which they had no control." I have brought to the attention of the Government that educated men exist not only in towns but also in villages; and that the Government should not handicap the young men residing in villages from entering Government service. "The secrets of vacancies must not be murmured in the ears only of the favourites of the Government, but should be widely advertised, and from the applications received, the best candidate must be selected. This has not been the policy of the Government, and it has led to much disappointment and discontent among the people living in the villages."

Mr. T. K. Krishna Menon.—May I know Sir, whether this is his present speech? For, I find that we have got all these in the proceedings.

Mr. K. T. Mathew.—I refer to the speech I have once made. To quote the words of another Member of this House, the Hon'ble Member for the Jewish Constituency, some time ago remarked:—"Sir, it is not that we have not had excellent principles initiated for the guidance of appointments in the service, that we are suffering now, but, Sir, it is because these principles and rules that have been laid down have not been

adhered to by the bureaucracy in the past." The Hon'ble Member for the Jenmi Constituency has explicitly stated that a Staff Selection Board should be created. This is what he said in the Makaram sitting of the Legislative Council (Vol. II, part 10, page 870).

"My idea is the best sons of the soil should be recruited to the services of the State without distinction of caste or creed. There are, no doubt, certain ugly features in the selection of candidates which ought to be avoided. I would urge the appointment of a Staff Selection Board, composed of the best men of the State, to prepare a list of candidates for all appointments from which list those in power are to select. The Board should be asked to state the preference and all reasons in writing in each case."

I do not want to dwell much on this subject. I have only to prove that there are sufficient reasons for appointing a Staff Selection Board and have done it by quoting the opinions expressed by many leading non-official Members of this House. I hope the Government will seriously consider this matter.

Dr. A. R. Menon.—Sir, I rise to second this motion. I do not want to withdraw a single word from what I said the other day, which the Hon'ble Member for Kunnankulam has done me the honour of quoting.

President.—Let me understand, before we proceed, whether the recruitment of the Staff Selection Board will be for the clerical staff or for higher appointments.

Dr. A. R. Menon.—We are concerned more with the higher appointments.

President.—So far as I have known, the Staff Selection Board in Madras publishes a list of candidates who will be entertained as clerks in Government service in the Fort St. George Gazette. I think, with regard to higher appointments, they have got the Public Service Commission.

Dr. A. R. Menon.—I am referring only to that. There should be a Public Service Commission.

President.—What do you mean by the Staff Selection Board?

Dr. A. R. Menon.—My object is only to point out the difficulties. Now, Sir, I have pointed out the other day and warned the Government what the consequences would be, if they do not follow rigorously their own rules laid down for their guidance. The Government can change any rule and any law they like, but I venture to say that, when once a law is laid down, they are as much amenable to that law as any one else. I

have pointed out the other day that certain fixed rules laid down for the guidance of the Government have been followed more ruthlessly. I am sorry to use this language, and people who have no business, come and step into the shoes of those who have served faithfully for more than 25 or 30 years in the service. Let me give an example. A man at the age of 55, according to the *Civil Service Regulations* must clear out of his place. You must show that consideration to all of them alike. Lately, the people of Chittur and Nemmara petitioned the Government requesting to retain in service one of the ablest and eminent physicians in the State. What was the reply? He was asked to clear out the very day. If you create an order to suit the convenience of the officials, then is it proper for you to reject the retention of the services of an eminent man, who has served the State faithfully for all these years?

President.—I think you refer to Dr. Subrahmanya Ayyar?

Dr. A. R. Menon.—Yes, Sir.

President.—Do you know all the facts in connection with the retirement of Dr. Subrahmanya Ayyar? He had two requests. One request was this, that, since he has not put in the requisite number of years of service to qualify him for half pension, he made a request to the Government that, in case they retire him, he may be given half pension. That was the first alternative; if that is not possible, to extend his service by the necessary period so that he may earn his half pension. The Government chose the first alternative, and agreed to give him the half pension and retired him.

Dr. A. R. Menon.—I am sorry that the Doctor had put in these two alternatives.

President.—Of course, it did not strike the Government that he was for being retained in the service. The first alternative was that he must be given half pension, even though he has not put in the requisite service, and the second was, if that was not possible, to extend the term for the necessary period to enable him to get half pension. The Government accepted the first alternative and agreed to give him half pension.

Dr. A. R. Menon.—I can only say, Sir, that Dr. Subrahmanya Ayyar's eminence is only in treating persons and not in literature. He gave the idea to the Government. I am glad that one of the alternatives has been satisfied.

Take another case. The Government has laid down a rule that, as far as possible, only people born in the State and brought up here, who are *bona fide* Cochinites—not the manufactured Cochinites—should be appointed in the State service,

and it is only after giving them all the places available that you should require the services of people from outside. I ask you, Sir, has the Government carried on this principle? I certainly can quote any number of instances, if you like, to show that they have not done it. I have remarked the other day that, whatever be the difficulties in carrying out the rules, they must be strictly adhered to. The whole work of this Legislative Council will be destroyed, unless and until there is a certain principle laid down for the selection of the best and ablest in the State. Has it so degenerated into a scramble for a few jobs which the Government can throw at the educated masses?

The number of educated people is increasing daily, and there are so many men employed at the rate of Rs. 10, and even graduates are employed as attenders in offices for Rs. 15. You can understand what extreme poverty has driven them to accept such small sums. Yet you go in for costly luxuries—unnecessary luxuries—from outside, and you shut the door upon our face. Therefore, it would do well for the Government to consider this question and hand over this responsibility to a committee, so that an individual may not take the responsibility. We do not want to show any communal favouritism to any one. But let there be a principle. He who has not got the brains and who has not the ability may not be entertained.

In *the Vicar of Wakefield*, when Richard applied for the post of a school-master, he was asked four questions. "Can you comb the hair of the boys?" "No." "Then you would not do for a school. Can you lie three on a bed?" "No." "Then you won't do for a school. Have you had small-pox?" He said "No." "You would not do for a school. Have you a good stomach?" "Yes." "Then you certainly won't do for a school". Similarly four questions are put by our Government, "Are you a Cochinite?" "Yes." "Then you would not do for a Government job. Are you a past master in the art of sycophancy and toadysm?" "No." "Then you would not do for a Government job." Then they ask a third question: "Have you got any people highly influenced in the State?" "No." "Then you certainly would not do for a Government job." Then they ask the fourth question, "After all, will you be able to carry out your work properly?" "Yes." "Then you are by no means qualified for a Government job." These are the four questions put by our Government, when anybody applies for a post. (*Laughter.*)

So for God's sake bring into being a Staff Selection Board or any committee to select candidates for appointments in the Government so that we may carry on the work of this Legislative

Council, which has been called in by His Highness the Maharaja, without going into the several appointments.

Mr. A. B. Salem.—Sir, I rise to support this motion. You know, Sir, in a little State like this, competition for employment will be very keen, especially in Cochin where we have statistics to show that, out of 2,400 graduates that have applied for appointments, we have not been able to provide for at least 400. Sir, from the statistics given here, that, out of 1,700 appointments, some particular class or section got 1,400 appointments during the last 20 years. It has accumulated. It is not the work of one day. All the time that these accumulations were going on we had these excellent rules also existing side by side. There is clear evidence to show that, during the last 30 years, these rules, as had been pointed out by the Hon'ble Member for Irinjalakkuda, have been more observed in the breach than in its observance. Therefore, it is high time that, when public opinion is focussed upon it, the Government should appoint an impartial board of men to select candidates and to pass the list on to the Government. However impartial the Diwan may be, motives will be attributed to him, when an appointment is made by him. It may be influence, it may be favouritism, or nepotism, or it may be anything else. To avoid such things, the idea of a Public Service Commission is mooted. We know, Sir, that highly paid people, even in British India and elsewhere, are not exempt from this charge. This charge is there, and the only way to get out of this charge is to institute an examination test or a selection board, where they will weigh the qualification of every man. We have got an excellent number of men in the Civil Service in India. They have all come there through the doors of competition and not through favouritism or selection. Now, Sir, I support it very much, and I think that the Government should not lose a single moment in bringing this Board into existence. We stated it last year, and we state again this year, and I do not know how many times more we will have to state it, before the Government would adopt it. But it is our duty to urge repeatedly upon the notice of the Government the necessity for such a board for selecting candidates for the public service. We have bitter complaints regarding the recent appointments in the services during 1101. I wanted to table a question to show how many persons were appointed last year. But I refrained from doing so, in order to avoid acrimonious discussion on it, which may take a turn on communal lines. Therefore, that question was avoided. But that does not show that there is no such feeling in the State. It is admitted on all

sides of the House, on the non-official side, who represent the masses of the population of the State, that there is this defect, and that there is no reason why the Government should not make an honest attempt to wash their hands off from this duty. In 1102 I hope we will have a Staff Selection Board.

Mr. M. K. Raman.—There are two important things which have been entrusted to me by the members of my community, when they elected me. If I am to do full justice to the work I have undertaken, I have to speak out in this Council and bring to the notice of the Government, fearlessly and even when things are very unpleasant, to the very face of the Government, various facts as they are, however, unpleasant they may be, Sir, my community is most aggrieved in.

President.—That is a communal question. You must be aware that it is often repeated before us. There is no question of allotting shares of posts to various communities. It is impracticable. I do not want you to refer to all these things. Your community has not been given appointments! If that is really the case, I can very well understand. It is easy to rise and say: "My community has not been represented, my community has not its due share of appointments". All these trench upon communal questions. You would do well not to touch upon these communal questions. We must always eschew these altogether from the deliberations of this Council.

Mr. M. K. Raman.—Certainly. I will try, as far as possible, not to tread upon communal lines, wherever it is possible to avoid them.

President.—It is not a question of possibility. The ruling is that "*you should not do it*". (*Hear, hear.*)

Mr. M. K. Raman.—There are instructions to the Government officials that, where men of equal efficiency apply for posts, selection should be given to such of the classes as are not adequately represented.

President.—Qualifications being equal.

Mr. M. K. Raman.—Try to give the appointments to those who are not represented in the service.

President.—What you say is that your community is not given due consideration in the matter of giving appointments. I cannot allow that.

Mr. M. K. Raman.—I am representing one community, and I have to ask for it. But now I am not asking for that. My object is not for creating communal dissensions here. But facts, as they are, I have to place before the House. I only ask the President to place these facts as they are before the Government. The other questions that engage the attention of

my constituency are the social and other disabilities. Wherever it is possible, of course, it is my duty in this Council to bring it to the notice of the House—the various difficulties my community is undergoing in respect of public matters. Even though it may be said that numerical strength has nothing to do with the appointments in the State but only education, at present, among the non-caste Hindus, it cannot be said that education is so very backward as it was a few years ago. Certainly, we are grateful to the Government for opening to us several High Schools and Colleges in the State. English Education has spread among us, and that is, perhaps, one of the reasons that has enabled us to open our eyes and see what position we are in. Therefore, unless the Government come forward to the rescue and encourage such of those as have received higher education, your opening of the schools to us will be in no way helping us. Unless a preference is shown in respect of candidates from the non-represented classes, I think, Sir, our fate will be very hard. In case a Staff Selection Board is appointed, it will be borne in mind by the Government that the members of that Board will be, as far as possible, the non-officials elected by this House. That is absolutely necessary. Otherwise the creation of a Staff Selection Board will be practically another obstacle to us.

President.—You say non-official members should be selected by this House.

Mr. M. K. Raman.—Yes, Sir.

President.—By the public?

Mr. M. K. Raman.—Yes, Sir, both mean the same. I say “by this House,” which means “by the public” and also with a non-official majority.

President.—Why should you have confidence only in the non-official members of this Board?

Mr. M. K. Raman.—The Government knows very well that the appointments are all properly given now, and still there is dissatisfaction among the people. If a Board consisting of the representatives of the public were to make such selection, it will, I hope, create greater satisfaction in the minds of the people. It would, therefore, be just and proper to have a non-official majority of two-thirds, in the Staff Selection Board.

President.—There are numerous applicants for a post. One alone can be chosen. All the others will have to be sent away. So then, there will be dissatisfaction among those who were not appointed. It is only one person that could be satisfied, when there are numerous applicants for one post. This contagion spreads.

Mr. M. K. Raman.—It is for the satisfaction of the public that I said that we should have a Staff Selection Board with a non-official majority, because the people will have greater confidence in the persons who represent them and who are elected by them.

President.—Resolutions are passed and submitted. These are easily done. But to satisfy their wants, the Government finds very difficult. Sometimes a vacancy arises, and there will be numerous applicants for the same. One could only be appointed, and the others who do not get the appointment go and spread the fact that they are not given appointments.

Mr. M. K. Raman.—According to things as they are in Cochin, the public seems to consist of different sections. That is a very unfortunate state of affairs.

President.—Then, we do not want the Legislative Council to stop all such differences and make the Cochin public one united whole.

Mr. M. K. Raman.—Every one must try to do that. That is certainly our object.

President.—But what we find here is otherwise.

Mr. M. K. Raman.—That is because there are certain staring facts before us for which the Government alone are responsible.

Sir, I say that non-official members in the Board should be in the same proportion as in the Council; two-thirds of the members should be non-officials. It should also be within the purview of the Staff Selection Board to select for the higher as well as the lower appointments of the State—in fact, all appointments made in the State service.

President.—That is to say, including appointments which should be made with the sanction of His Highness.

Dr. A. R. Menon.—Which are those appointments, Sir?

President.—There are numerous appointments which require the sanction of His Highness.

Mr. C. Achyuta Menon.—All the appointments put in italics in *the Budget Estimate* require the sanction of His Highness.

President.—“Staff” generally means “clerks” and not “the Heads of Departments.” That is why they call it a Staff Selection Board which selects candidates for the posts of clerks. The Board conducts an examination, and the list of candidates who pass in such examination is published for appointment in the several offices. But what is the use of selecting candidates, when we cannot provide them with posts.

Mr. A. Eachara Menon.—In the Staff Selection Board also the selection goes by recommendation.

President.—What is the Staff Selection Board going to do? We should know that first. Otherwise, what is the use of considering this matter. After all, if you go through the Gazette of the Madras Government, you will find that the Staff Selection Board is only concerned with the appointment of clerks. We find several names there.

Mr. M. K. Raman.—The mover, the Member who started this motion, meant all the appointments in the State, and it is in that sense I support it.

President.—It may be a Public Service Commission. Even the Public Service Commission does not make all the Government appointments, though it is intended to make all the higher as well as the lower appointments. For, the I. C. S. people do not fall under the Public Service Commission.

Mr. Sheik Abdul Qadir Sahib Bahadur.—The Madras Staff Selection Board conducts a competitive examination, and those who pass in that are selected, and their names are put in the Fort St. George Gazette. Appointments in the Government should be made only from those thus selected.

President.—The details of the working of the Staff Selection Board we have not gone into.

Mr. A. B. Salem.—If we accept the principles of the Board, then, the details could be worked out. Whether by competitive examination or some other way, candidates are to be selected.

President.—I do not know, if it has been within the contemplation of the mover and the seconder, when they referred to the Staff Selection Board, that higher appointments also should be brought within its scope—all those appointments within the competence of the Staff Selection Board and of those of the Public Service Commission.

Mr. M. Krishna Menon.—I do not think that the appointments made by His Highness could come under the Staff Selection Board.

Mr. M. K. Raman.—All the appointments may be made by a Staff Selection Board. I want only the Government to accept the principle that appointments should be left in the hands of a body.

President.—You want to take away the prerogative rights of His Highness the Maharaja in making appointments of suitable persons to certain posts, and then it may not be right to encroach upon the rights of His Highness.

Mr. A. B. Salem.—As it stands now, the Diwan makes a recommendation to His Highness, and it is left to His Highness to appoint the person or appoint some other person

for that post. What would be done in future would be the Public Service Commission or a committee would submit the name to the Diwan, and the Diwan would submit the name to His Highness. It will be left to His Highness to accept the nominee or nominate somebody else. The Staff Selection Board or Public Service Commission is only a body which simply brings to the notice of the Government a list of candidates who are eligible for appointment. The discussion is simply to come to an understanding who should bring the name of the person before His Highness. So no prerogative right of His Highness is taken away, and not a member would take such a step.

Dr. A. R. Menon.—What you do now is you make appointments subject to His Highness' sanction.

President.—I make appointments, but they require His Highness' sanction.

Mr. M. K. Raman.—Instead of the Diwan recommending, the committee, if it is formed, will be recommending. That is all the object of this Staff Selection Board.

Mr. M. K. Raman.—With regard to higher appointments, the attention of this House has already been invited. I suppose, when applicants of equal efficiency apply, certainly, preference should be given to the non-represented classes. In this connection, I may point out the inconsistency in principle of making appointments from the non-represented classes.

President.—But Mr. Raman, there must be persons available.

Mr. M. K. Raman.—Do you mean to say, for the lower appointments at least, there are not enough people in the non-Hindu community? No, I can assure you that there are ever so many persons who have received education fairly, though not to a high standard. It was not so some years back, when the schools were not thrown open to them. As it is now, there are any number of persons in my community to fill up the lower orders of appointments, although there are only very few for the higher posts. With these few observations, I support the motion.

Mr. K. T. Mathew.—If the Government would consider over this matter, then I beg to withdraw.

President.—We cannot give an assurance that the Government will consider the matter.

Dr. A. R. Menon.—We are only representing these various aspects so that you may consider it.

Mr. S. F. Nunez.—We have first of all to consider whether this point could be considered. (*Laughter.*)

It being 5 p. m., the House rose for the day to meet again the next day.

T. K. KRISHNA MENON,
Secretary to the Council.